

Multi-media narratives for research into the influences of educational leadership and professional learning

Jack Whitehead, Liverpool Hope University.

Notes for a presentation to a Staff Seminar at Bath Spa University
on the 7th June 2011.

Abstract

The ideas in this presentation are focused on the generation of educational knowledge that is at the forefront of the field. This knowledge is in the form of living educational theories that can explain the educational influences of educational leadership and professional learning with multi-media narratives. A living educational theory is an individual's explanation for their educational influence in their own learning, in the learning of others and in the learning of the social formations in which we live and work. The significance of multi-media narratives is that they extend some limitations in our binocular vision into our relationally dynamic awareness of the movement of bodies in space and boundaries; our proprioception.

Drawing on multi-media narratives already legitimated by Bath Spa University, the University of Bath and other Universities, I intend to show how the living standards of judgment in these multi-media narratives are at the leading edge of the generation of an inclusional epistemology for educational knowledge.

Introduction

I first want to thank Steve Coombs and the organizers of the staff seminars at Bath Spa University for the invitation to share with you some ideas from my educational research programme into educational theories. You may know that between 1973-2009 my research programme was based at the University of Bath in the School/Department of Education. Since my full time employment finished with my 65th Birthday in August 2009 I have been continuing my research programme in the Centre for the Child and Family at Liverpool Hope University.

I shall focus on the possibility that multi-media narratives of research into the influences of educational leadership and professional learning that have already been legitimated by staff at Bath Spa University and the University of Bath could, through further reflection, be seen to be at the forefront of contributions to educational knowledge.

Bath Spa University offers a range of taught, independent and core study modules for professional learning. The approaches to learning include:

- personal and professional reflection and evaluation;
- critical discussion and debate;
- the critiquing of theoretical frameworks; and,
- the sharing of practice.

Tutors help students to produce evidence of professional learning from work-based tasks (or equivalent) and relate these to appropriate research literature. (Bath Spa University 2009; 16)

What I think could be made explicit in the approaches to professional learning is the significance of the knowledge-creating capacities of professional learners in the personal and professional reflection and evaluation.

For example, in 2009 Bath Spa University awarded a masters degree to Christine Jones for the knowledge created in her enquiry, *How do I improve my Practice as an inclusion Officer working in a Children's service* (Jones 2009). I shall begin my presentation with an analysis of Jones' accomplishment that suggests that the University has already legitimated the embodied knowledge of a practitioner-researcher in a way that could place it at the forefront of the professional and academic knowledge base of education.

This analysis and suggestion will be followed by a similar analysis of the doctorates of Karen and Simon Riding:

Karen Riding's Ph.D. (2008) Thesis, *How do I come to understand my shared living educational standards of judgement in the life I lead with others? Creating the space for intergenerational student-led research*. Retrieved 6 June 2011 from <http://www.actionresearch.net/karenridingphd.shtml>

Simon Riding's Ph.D. (2008) Thesis, How do I contribute to the education of myself and others through improving the quality of living educational space? The story of living myself through others as a practitioner-researcher. Retrieved 6 June 2011 from <http://www.actionresearch.net/simonridingphd.shtml>

Simon Riding's thesis was externally examined by Steve Coombs. Hence Steve has been influential in legitimating the knowledge generated by another practitioner-researcher, an educational leader (Deputy Headteacher) in creating and sustaining a teacher-researcher group at Bitterne Park School.

Karen Riding's thesis was externally examined by Ron Ritchie, from the University of the West of England. The success of this examination legitimated the knowledge created by Karen Riding in explaining how students could become educational leaders in supporting the learning of fellow pupils in intergenerational student-led research.

Following this analysis I shall draw insights from some other doctoral research programmes I have supervised on educational leadership and professional learning, as well as my own writings to show how multi-media narratives are generating the new epistemology for the new scholarship that Schon (1995) wanted to create following Boyer's (1990) extension of the ideas of scholarship to include, discover, application, integration and teaching. The new epistemology has emerged from making public the embodied knowledge of educators. I also want to draw your attention to the significance of the ideas of Alan Rayner (2011) on inclusionality for the generation of this epistemology.

1) Making public and legitimating the embodied knowledge of educators

I have spent most of my working life in education with a sense of vocation about the importance of making public, and evolving, the embodied knowledge of educators in their professional learning as they ask, research and answer questions of the kind, 'How do I improve what I am doing?' My vocational desire to do this emerged in 1971 from the recognition, whilst studying for my masters degree, that the disciplines approach to education was mistaken. This was the view that educational theory was constituted by the philosophy, psychology, sociology of education. The mistaken assumption of the disciplines approach was that the practical principles used by educators to explain their educational influences in learning were at best pragmatic maxims having a first crude and superficial justification in practice and that would be replaced in any rationally developed theory (Hirst, 1983; 18).

My own view continues to be that practitioner-researchers can generate their own explanations for their educational influences in learning (their living educational theories) whilst drawing insights from the disciplines of education.

What I want to focus on is the nature of the explanatory principles that professional educators and educational researcher use to explain educational influences in learning. I am thinking of explanatory principles that are inclusional in the sense that they are grounded in energy-flowing values and informed by a relationally dynamic awareness of space and boundaries. Consider the MA Professional Learning of Christine Jones awarded by Bath Spa University

in 2009. This included Jones' dissertation on her enquiry, *How do I improve my practice as an inclusion officer working in a children's service?* (see <http://www.actionresearch.net/living/cjmaok/cjma.htm>)

Abstract

This dissertation examines my embodied knowledge and development as an Inclusion Officer working in a Children's Service as I focus on making a contribution to educational knowledge. In making this contribution, I have used visual narratives. This dissertation focuses on my personal knowledge and experience as an Inclusion Officer as I inquire into my question, 'How do I improve my practice as an Inclusion Officer?' In making my personal knowledge public, I believe that I am contributing to educational knowledge by using a living theory methodology for exploring the implications of questions such as, 'How do I improve my practice?' and by clarifying the meanings of inclusional standards of judgement from a perspective of inclusionality. Inclusionality (Rayner, 2004) may be described as a relationally dynamic and responsive awareness of others which flows with a desire to live values of care, compassion, love, justice and democracy. I explicate the inclusional way in which I like to work with others, how my practice is based on the values I hold and how this is reflected in my relationship with other educators working in a Children's Service and schools.

In undertaking my inquiry, I have adopted a living theory methodology (Whitehead, 2008a) in the sense that I am bringing my embodied knowledge into the public domain as an explanation of my educational influences in my own learning, in the learning of others and in the learning of social formations. Using video, I clarify the meanings of my inclusional values and how they are formed into living standards of judgement, whereby I and others can judge the validity of my claim to knowledge.

Here is a brief video-narrative from Jones' dissertation that I shall use to communicate my meanings of energy-flowing values:

My first memory of being treated 'unfairly' was when I was in what would now be called Reception Class. My teacher called me a naughty girl in front of the class for inadvertently damaging the wall display behind me as a result my swinging on a chair. I remember vividly how I felt at the time. I was extremely upset as I had not realised what I had been doing and to be publicly humiliated in this way was unnecessary and damaging. I remember thinking at the time that one day I would become a teacher and 'do it the right way'. I expressed these views to my colleagues.

Plate 1: Chris speaking to colleagues



<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jXvrgS5xdY>

As I watch the video clip, I see myself reflecting on that time in the classroom as I describe my experience. As I am speaking, I can see the classroom and where I am sitting, and I can see the teacher at the front of the classroom. I am feeling those emotions that I felt at the time.

As we watch the video I shall use a process (Huxtable, 2009) I refer to as empathetic resonance to describe the experience of my strongest emotional response to hearing, seeing and feeling the communication through the video. My strongest response is where Jones says 'I was mortified' at 1:05 minutes into the clip. In her reflections Jones says, "*I remember thinking at the time that one day I would become a teacher and 'do it the right way'.*" What I think Jones is showing us with the help of the visual data is a relational dynamic awareness in her description of herself in the classroom. She is aware of her neighbourhood as well as the influence of this neighbourhood in herself.

As Jones tells her story I also feel an empathetic responses with what I call the expression of a life-affirming energy. I hope that you can experience the expression of this energy in my own presentation this evening. I do love what I am doing in education. I feel a flow of life-affirming energy through my work with other educators whose values I feel are carrying hope for the future of humanity. Any valid explanation of my educational influence in my own learning and in the learning of others must, I believe, include my energy-flowing values.

Another such educator is Mark Potts, one of your doctoral students. I tutored Mark's Educational Enquiry Masters Module of Sept. 2002, on - *How can I use my own values and my experience of schools in South Africa to influence my own education and the education of others?* at:

<http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/module/mpsa.pdf>

Mark expresses his optimism, sadness and anger in his encounter with a 17 year old student:

ABSTRACT

The focus of this project is my experience of South African education. A visit with a group of colleagues in February 2002 had great personal significance for me. It led to me examining my own educational values and the extent to which I fully live them out. It spurred me on to learn more and to influence others to act with me in establishing a link with a black township school. This is the story of my learning



and the learning of others as I began the process of establishing the link.

Perhaps it was the optimism that I felt as I spoke with this 17 year old student of Economics about his aspirations to go on to College and be an accountant, followed by the sadness as I spoke afterwards to his teacher who told me that there was no prospect of this because the family was too poor to pay the College fees. In my mind I thought of the opportunities lying ahead of the children in the well-resourced schools that I had seen during my visit. That was the source of the anger that I felt.

Mark Pott's developed his ideas in his multi-media Dissertation with its inclusion of presencing and mindfulness on:

How can I improve my practice by communicating more effectively with others in my role as a professional educator?

<http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/monday/mpmadis.pdf>

Abstract

In this dissertation I seek to show my learning as an educator as I try to improve my practice and gain an understanding of how it is that I influence others. Using my own values as an educator and drawing on ideas such as presencing (Scharmer 2000) and mindfulness (Claxton 1997), I seek to understand better how I communicate with others and connect with them at a deeper level, influencing their actions. Words are not enough to express my meaning and therefore I have presented this dissertation with video clips to try to demonstrate my meaning more completely. It is written as a narrative with events recounted mostly chronologically. There is a limited amount of re-ordering. This is the narrative of my life as a teacher researcher with many different demands on my time. I have taken time, usually during school holidays, to reflect on the problem of how to be a more effective communicator allowing slow, unforced development extending over a year. This approach has allowed my deeper thoughts to surface and to guide my writing. I have so many interactions each day with my colleagues and my students that I seek here to understand how I can ensure good intuitive responses, making a lot out of a little. (Potts, 2004)

In the process of supporting practitioner-researchers in making public their embodied knowledge in their masters and doctoral research programmes I take care to have understood the question which the dissertation or thesis answers:

Whether a given proposition is true or false, significant or meaningless, depends on what question it was meant to answer; and any one who wishes to know whether a given proposition is true or false, significant or meaningless, must first find out what question it was meant to answer (Collingwood, 1991, p. 39)

I also spend time responding to the draft and redrafts of the Abstract to do what I can to make sure that it communicates the originality of the contribution to knowledge being made by the researcher. Because of this careful attention to both the question and the Abstract I like to hear them expressed in the researchers own voice.

Karen Riding, asked, researched and answered her question, *How do I come to understand my shared living educational standards of judgment in the life I lead with others? Creating the space for intergenerational student-led research* in her thesis with the following Abstract.

Abstract

In this account I explain the shared life that I lead with my husband Simon transforms itself into a loving energy that emerges in our educational practice. This loving way of being emerges as the energy that drives me to transform the social formation of the school to work alongside student researchers in an intergenerational and sustainable way. These living and loving standards of

judgment are shared between us, asking the other to be the best that s/he can be and valuing the contribution that s/he makes. I live out an inclusional way of being that extends across the professional and personal domain, asking me to be responsive to the others with whom I share this life. This account attempts to explicate the emergence and significance of these standards between those in my life. The boundaries shared between participants on this journey are fluid and dynamic. They are permeable, yet also recognise the limitations of certain relationships into impermeable boundaries. In the current debate about personalised learning within education, I see a new language of education emerging, shared between school and student researchers that places learning at its heart. I am supporting Schon's (1995) call for the emergence of a new epistemology for educational knowledge with the expression and clarification of new living standards of judgment that can contribute to enhancing educational space. (Riding, K. 2008, Abstract <http://www.actionresearch.net/karenridingphd.shtml>)

Simon Riding asked, researched and answered his question, *How do I contribute to the education of myself and others through improving the quality of living educational space? The story of living myself through others as a practitioner-researcher*, in his thesis with the following Abstract:

Abstract

Within this text I propose and demonstrate an original relationally dynamic standard of judgement within my practice of Living Myself Through Others. I explore the ongoing nature of transition between living educational spaces upon myself and how this process of change is addressed as I move through different stages of my career and life. I argue that I am able to improve the quality of the living educational space because of the relationships and experiences that I have had, alongside the living core values that I hold. This thesis reflects on the potential impact of enabling teachers to engage as teacher-researchers within their own school and accounts for the process I went through in order to make this happen. I further argue for the need to consider how practitioner accounts are assessed in order to ensure that the future of education is driven forward through the development of teachers as researchers influencing what educational knowledge is and how it is produced. The following text is a living educational theory action research enquiry that utilises autobiography as a way of accounting for one educator's transitions from being a classroom teacher, through middle leadership and finally into senior school leadership. I argue that I am the educator that I am because of the life I have led and the life that I am currently leading. This thesis addresses the vastly important influence of relationships within education and explores how these relationships impact on my practice as an educator. The text incorporates and captures these relationships through enabling these others to speak through their own voice. This thesis explores how I was able to create the shared living educational space necessary to enable teacher-research to occur and flourish. (Riding, S. 2008, Abstract - <http://www.actionresearch.net/simonridingphd.shtml>)

Karen and Simon Riding have made public their embodied knowledge as educators. Their Abstracts emphasise the importance of loving energy, space, boundaries, leadership and relationally dynamic standards of judgment.

Jacqueline Delong (2002) has researched her educational leadership as a Superintendent of Schools in Ontario, Canada in her enquiry, *How can I improve my practice as a superintendent of schools and create my own living educational theory?*

<http://www.actionresearch.net/living/delong.shtml>

Abstract

One of the basic tenets of my philosophy is that the development of a culture for improving learning rests upon supporting the knowledge-creating capacity in each individual in the system. Thus, I start with my own. This thesis sets out a claim to know my own learning in my educational inquiry, 'How can I improve my practice as a superintendent of schools?' Out of this philosophy emerges my belief that the professional development of each teacher rests in their own knowledge-creating capacities as they examine their own practice in helping their students to improve their learning. In creating my own educational theory and supporting teachers in creating theirs, we engage with and use insights from the theories of others in the process of improving student learning. The originality of the contribution of this thesis to the academic and professional knowledge-base of education is in the systematic way I transform my embodied educational values into educational standards of practice and judgement in the creation of my living educational theory. In the thesis I demonstrate how these values and standards can be used critically both to test the validity of my knowledge-claims and to be a powerful motivator in my living educational inquiry. The values and standards are defined in terms of valuing the other in my professional practice, building a culture of inquiry, reflection and scholarship and creating knowledge.

The focus in Chapter 4 is on *Creating my embodied knowing in being a leader* at <http://www.actionresearch.net/living/delong.shtml> and Delong continues to work at the development of multi-media narratives of educational leadership and professional learning as in A) below.

I now want to focus on the significance of the public legitimation of this knowledge in the creation of a new epistemology for educational knowledge. This significance is closely related to the aspirations of Universities to make original and recognised contributions to knowledge.

2) Producing a new epistemology for educational knowledge from making public the embodied knowledge of educators

Over the past 12 months I have presented several accounts which provide more detail that I can cover in this presentation on producing a new epistemology for educational knowledge from making public the embodied knowledge of educators. The outlines of four of these presentation, together with how to

access them, are given below. In the concluding section I shall draw your attention to the importance of Alan Rayner's idea of inclusionality in the generation of the new epistemology and to an ongoing conversation in a practitioner-researcher JISC e-seminar which you are invited to join and to contribute your own thoughts. You can join or leave this e-seminar from:

<https://www.jiscmail.ac.uk/cgi-bin/webadmin?SUBED1=practitioner-researcher&A=1>

The four presentations focused on:

A) *Creating An Educational Epistemology In The Multi-Media Narratives Of Living Educational Theories And Living Theory Methodologies.* This paper was presented at the Annual BERA Conference at the University of Warwick, 2nd September 2010

B) *Accounting for Ourselves in Our Living Educational Theories.* Notes for a presentation for the Foundation Hour at Liverpool Hope University on the 12th January 2011.

C) *Transforming educational knowledge through making explicit the embodied knowledge of educators for the public good.* This paper was presented with Jacqueline Delong on the 9th April 2011 at the American Educational Research Association Conference in New Orleans.

D) *How do I improve what I am doing in seeking to live and evolve my values as fully as I can and contribute to educational knowledge?* A presentation on the 1st June 2011 to the Value and Virtue in Practice-Based Research Conference held at York St. John University.

A) *Creating An Educational Epistemology In The Multi-Media Narratives Of Living Educational Theories And Living Theory Methodologies.* A paper presented at the Annual BERA Conference at the University of Warwick, 2nd September 2010.

<http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/bera10/jwbera10individual310810.pdf>

Video of the presentation

Part 1 of 2, 14 minutes 41 seconds - <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-2aGdPXBSeI>

Part 2 of 2, 14 minutes 28 seconds at
http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qMnR_rOkSGE

Background of the research and relevance to BERA members

Recent issues of Research Intelligence (102, 103, 104, 105, 107, 109 and 110, Whitehead, 2010a) have raised questions about limitations of printed, text base media of educational research, such as the British Educational Research Journal (BERJ), for communicating the meanings of the energy-flowing values that

contribute to the explanatory principles that can be used to explain educational influences in learning.

There has also been much discussion in the AERA publication *Educational Researcher* (2009) about discourses on narrative research together with a lack of clarity about what constitutes educational research as distinct from education research. In a BERA 09 keynote symposium on an educational epistemology for educational knowledge, practitioner-researchers provided evidence-based narratives to justify their claims that they had created and legitimated, within their doctoral enquiries, a relationally dynamic epistemology for educational knowledge (BERA09). The contributions to this keynote symposium can be seen as an answer to Schön's (1995) call for the development of a new epistemology for the scholarship of teaching and to Snow's (2001) call for the development of methodologies for making public the professional knowledge of teachers.

This paper continues to contribute to this new epistemology and methodology with evidence-based contributions on the use of multi-media narratives for communicating the nature of living educational theories and living theory methodologies. The idea of a living educational theory is that it is an explanation produced by an individual to explain their educational influences in their own learning, in the learning of others and in the learning of the social formations in which they live and work. The originality of the paper lies in the use of a method for using empathetic resonance with video-data to clarify the meanings of energy-flowing values as explanatory principles in explanations of educational influence in learning. A key concern is to show how these narratives are able to resist becoming unwitting tools of integrated world capitalism (Guattari, 2000, pp.48-49) by focusing the research on both improving practice and generating knowledge with educational values that carry hope for the future of humanity. These values will be related to a particular commitment to education as a means of 'humanizing society' and 'facilitating the flourishing of humanity' (Liverpool Hope University 2010).

B) Accounting for Ourselves in Our Living Educational Theories.

Notes for a presentation for the Foundation Hour at Liverpool Hope University on the 12th January 2011

See the 42:32 minute video of the actual presentation at:



<http://tinyurl.com/6j65z64>

“I want to thank the organizers of The Foundation Hour for the invitation to share ideas from my research programme into living educational theories. I am hoping that you will find that my ideas are consistent with the vision and purpose of the Strategic Map 2010-11 of the Faculty of Education of Liverpool Hope University:

Vision: *The guiding vision and orientation of the Faculty is to develop educational thought and practices which promote education as a humanising influence on each person and on society locally, nationally and internationally.*

Purpose: *To contribute to the development of knowledge and understanding in all fields of education, characterising all work with values arising from hope and love. (LHU, 2010)* “

I want to highlight the significance of this purpose, because in holding myself to account for living my values as fully as I can in explanations of my educational influence in learning, I use love and hope as living standards of judgment.

C) Transforming educational knowledge through making explicit the embodied knowledge of educators for the public good. A paper presented with Jacqueline Delong on the 9th April 2011 to the American Educational Research Association Conference in New Orleans, USA.

<http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/aera11/jdjwaera11.pdf>

Abstract

This paper focuses on making explicit the embodied knowledge of educators using a living theory methodology and inciting the social imagination to create educational research for the public good. Using evidence from international contexts, the meanings of the energy-flowing values that educators use to explain their educational influences in their own learning and in the learning of others, are becoming more explicit. The evidence includes the living educational theories of professional educators, educational leaders and students as they study their practice in improving practice and creating cultures of inquiry. The authors study their practice in their own contexts building on learning from each other and from critiques of AERA presentations in improving the interpretation of multimedia data to represent and generate knowledge. Visual narratives are used to bring practitioner knowledge into the Academy with living standards of judgment.

D) How do I improve what I am doing in seeking to live and evolve my values as fully as I can and contribute to educational knowledge? A presentation on the 1st June 2011 to the Value and Virtue in Practice-Based Research Conference held at York St. John University.

<http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/jack/jwValuesandVirtue290511opt.pdf>

The Successful Proposal

My research is influenced by the guiding vision and orientation of the Centre for the Child and Family in Liverpool Hope University. These are to generate knowledge which directly improves the world and engage in research to create ways of living and working that have a humanising influence on children, families and wider society. It is also influenced by the wider mission of the Faculty of Education in its aspirations to develop knowledge and understanding that will contribute to the education and wellbeing of all as a globally significant endeavour whilst characterizing all work with values arising from love and hope.

The presentation will show how I am responding to the research question: *How do we integrate research and practice, across disciplines and between professions, to enable a demonstrable improvement in the wellbeing of children and young people?* It will show how I am contributing to the creation of a distinctive approach to scholarship through the integration of research, teaching, and the application of knowledge in practice. This includes the development of a living theory approach to action research and the integration and evolution of this approach in professional and community settings, to discover better ways of improving 'the wellbeing of children, families, communities and wider society' (Walton, 2010).

The research will draw on data from:

- i) the livinglearning website at <http://www.livinglearning.org.uk/>,
- ii) the Aiming High for Children project at Liverpool Hope University,
- iii) the Keynsham Kind community based project coordinated by William House and facilitated by Marian and Shaun Naidoo in Keynsham, UK,
- iv) the global networks of practitioner-researchers contributing to <http://www.actionresearch.net> and to <http://www.jeanmcniff.com/>

Reference

Walton, J. (2010) The Centre for the Child and Family: Strategic Map 2011 – 2012. Retrieved 4 March 2011 from <http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/walton/CfCFStrategicMap2011.pdf>

XXXXXXXXXXXX

Alan Rayner's idea of inclusionality and participating in an ongoing educational conversation.

Alan Rayner's idea of inclusionality as a relationally dynamic awareness of space and boundaries, helped me to see limitations in my propositional dialectical ways of knowing (Whitehead and Rayner, 2009) in the evolution of my living educational theory:

Natural inclusionality correspondingly explains how it is possible, without contradiction, for natural forms not only to be distinct and diverse but also dynamically continuous, through having variably fluid figural boundaries permeated by space that cannot be cut. Hence the physicality of all form arises as

variably viscous flow-form, an energetic configuration of space throughout figure and figure in space, combining both local and non-local qualities. With this new physicality come possibilities of new scientific, mathematical, spiritual and socio-political understandings, along with the removal of the unrealistic grounds for opposition between 'each' and 'other(s)', that contribute to profound human conflict and environmental damage. For these possibilities to be realized, new forms of communication and educational practice may be needed.

For example, within the field of living educational theories (Whitehead and McNiff 2006), the language and logic of natural inclusionality may greatly assist the work of individuals in showing that their 'living I' is not an hermetically sealed, autonomous unit isolated from its neighbourhood. Indeed, this is already happening (e.g. see Naidoo 2005; Adler Collins 2007; Tuyl 2009). Each individual finds identity not in the inner self, alone, but in the variably receptive, reflective and responsive energetic relationship with its limitless and changeable surroundings. This fundamentally psychological understanding holds the hope, perhaps the only hope, for sustaining the flourishing of humanity in a world that has been drawn to the brink of environmental and social breakdown through the assumption that space can be cut. As Michael Polanyi (1958) put it:

"For once men have been made to realize the crippling mutilations imposed by an objectivist framework—once the veil of ambiguities covering up these mutilations has been definitely dissolved—many fresh minds will turn to the task of reinterpreting the world as it is, and as it then once more will be seen to be." (Rayner, 2011; 182)

Rayner stresses the importance of acknowledging the significance of painful experiences in one's existence.

Because I do not wish to be understood as failing to recognise some of the damaging constraints on the pooling of a loving dynamic energy I want to acknowledge the influence of Erich Fromm's work where he describes the evil of what he calls a 'malignant narcissus':

"In discussing the pathology of narcissism it is important to distinguish between two forms of narcissism – one benign, the other malignant. In the benign form, the object of narcissism is the result of a person's effort. Thus, for instance, a person may have a narcissistic pride in his work as a carpenter, as a scientist, or as a farmer. Inasmuch as the object of his narcissism is something he has to work for, his exclusive interest in what is his work and his achievement is constantly balanced by his interest in the process of work itself, and the material he is working with. The dynamics of this benign narcissism thus are self-checking. The energy which propels the work is, to a large extent, of a narcissistic nature, but the very fact that the work itself makes it necessary to be related to reality, constantly curbs the narcissism and keeps it within bounds. This mechanism may explain why we find so many narcissistic people who are at the same time highly creative.

In the case of malignant narcissism, the object of narcissism is not anything the person does or produces, but something he has; for instance, his body, his looks, his

health, his wealth, etc. The malignant nature of this type of narcissism lies in the fact that it lacks the corrective element which we find in the benign form.

If I am "great" because of some quality I have, and not because of something I achieve, I do not need to be related to anybody or anything; I need not make any effort. In maintaining the picture of my greatness I remove myself more and more from reality and I have increase the narcissistic charge in order to be better protected from the danger than my narcissistically inflated ego might be revealed as the product of my empty imagination. Malignant narcissism, thus, is not self-limiting, and in consequence it is crudely solipsistic as well as xenophobic. One who has learned to achieve cannot help acknowledging that others have achieved similar things in similar ways – even if his narcissism may persuade him that his own achievement is greater than that of others. One who has achieved nothing will find it difficult to appreciate the achievements of others, and thus he will be forced to isolate himself increasingly in narcissistic splendor. "(p.77)

You may also have found it as necessary as I have done, in the course of living a productive life to develop boundaries that protect you from such narcissism as you deepen and extend your contributions to educational knowledge.

If we are to look back on a creative and productive life in which we have contributed to the expression of values that carry hope for the future of humanity, I believe that it is important not to tell a 'smooth story of self' (MacLure, 1996; 283) and to subject the validity of our living educational theories to the most stringent and rigorous criticisms we can devise.

This concern with validity helps to ensure that we reduce bias and prejudice in our interpretations of what we are doing, and that we can benefit from the collective wisdom of each other as we seek to live loving and productive lives, in the service of education and humanity. My own way of reducing bias and prejudice is to place my explanations of educational influence in public forums such as this with the request that you subject my ideas to rigorous criticism in relation to their comprehensibility, their truth, their rightness and their authenticity in the sense that you can see that over time and interaction I am committed to living as fully as possible the values I claim to live by (Habermas, 1976, pp. 2-3).

In 1985 I recall the damaging influence of global capitalism as some 80 advisers within the Avon Local Education Authority received their termination of employment notices on the day that I started a workshop with the advisers on an action research approach to curriculum development!

The most recent global crisis is now affecting our local educational provision with increasing threats to jobs and provision in education and children's services. Everyone will be affected as we try to minimize the damage and continue to protect and enhance the influence of our humanizing values and understandings. What we can do, in the face of economic rationalism, is to continue to integrate our understandings of the de-valuing and de-moralising pressures of economic rationalism (McTaggart, 1992, p. 50) whilst working together, in our collaborative enquiries and ongoing conversations, to hold firm to extending the influence of the humanizing values arising from our love and

hope.

Participating in ongoing educational conversations

In concluding these notes I want to draw your attention to the following individuals and sites which are informing my continuing research programme and educational conversations.

Margaret Farren and Yvonne Crotty, two colleagues at Dublin City University, work together and with their students in ways that help me to feel connected to a pooling of life-affirming energy, love and hope. Crotty is Director of the 2011 Conference on Developing Innovative Visual Educational Resources for Students Everywhere (DIVERSE) and you can access the details of DIVERSE 2011 at:

<http://diverse2011.dcu.ie/welcome.html>

The conference theme is on: Creativity – Enhancing our vision for the future and includes the following topics:

1. Creativity, Visual Literacy with New Media
2. Social Media and Virtual Learning in a Changing World
3. Digital Video - Projects and cases
4. Making the eHealth connection - innovative uses of Technology in Health

Details of the action research workshop I shall be leading with Margaret Farren at DIVERSE 2011 are at:

<http://diverse2011.dcu.ie/programmesactionresearch.html>

and details of the work of Margaret Farren are at:

<http://webpages.dcu.ie/~farrenm/>

Margaret is the Chair of the Editorial Board of the Educational Journal of Living Theories which can be accessed at: <http://ejolts.net/>

Much of my learning takes place through reading and conversation and I have convened a practitioner-researcher e-seminar on JISC for the past 7 years. Here is my posting to this e-seminar on the 5th June that I copied to the Collaborative Action Research Network, NING e-space:

"In a conversation, following the symposium from Liverpool Hope University's Centre for the Child and Family at the Conference on Value and Virtue in Practice-based Research in York St. John University on the 1st June, there was a discussion initiated by Joan Walton about the possibility of forming a collaborative/cooperative/participatory question and project.

I'm hoping that you will read Catherine Forester's contribution to the Symposium:

How do I sustain an expression of loving insight in my life and work as an educator coming to the end of my career?

at

<http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/york/foresterc.pdf>,

to see if it evokes any desire (as it does for me) to work together in a collaborative project that includes our creation and co-creation of our living legacies.

The details of all the Abstracts with four of the five presentations are below for your interest.

Symposium of research from the Centre for the Child and Family, Liverpool Hope University – 5 papers. Wednesday 1st June 2011, 15.30 – 17.30. See the Abstracts at:

<http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/york/absyork11.pdf>

William House, Marian Naidoo, Shaun Naidoo. *Keynsham Kind – a project to enhance well-being through the process of well-becoming. (see Abstracts)*

Marie Huxtable. *Researching to improve my practice in living boundaries: Exploring the creation of my living theory as I explore my systemic educational responsibility.* <http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/york/huxtablem.pdf>

Catherine Forester. *How do I sustain an expression of loving insight in my life and work as an educator coming to the end of my career?* <http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/york/foresterc.pdf>

Joan Walton. *Transforming the world through transforming self.* <http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/york/waltonj.pdf>

Jack Whitehead. *How do I improve what I am doing in seeking to live and evolve my values as fully as I can and contribute to educational knowledge?* <http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/york/whiteheadj.pdf>

If anyone wants to join in this conversation, as well as responding in this CARN Ning forum they can do so from:

<https://www.jiscmail.ac.uk/cgi-bin/webadmin?SUBED1=practitioner-researcher&A=1>

As you know I'm giving a Mandela Day Lecture in South Africa on the 18th July 2011 and if anyone has urls to share that relate to the values of Mandela Day, do please send them on for me to include in my presentation.

Love Jack"

I should perhaps explain the 'Love Jack' at the end of my e-mails. Here is the signature I use:

When Martin Dobson, a colleague in the Department of Education at the University of Bath, died in 2002 the last thing he said to me was 'Give my Love to the Department'. In the 20 years I'd worked with Martin it was his loving warmth of humanity that I recall with great life affirming pleasure and I'm hoping that in Love Jack we can share this value of common humanity.

To reinforce the importance of bringing loving, energy-flowing and relationally dynamic values as explanatory principles into the Academy through multi-media narratives, here is a response from Brian Wakeman to the above e-mail:

On 6 Jun 2011, at 11:38, Brian Wakeman wrote:

I've just looked at Catherine's paper about loving insight and grace.

Although I approach love and grace from a different angle I admired the courage of the paper and the high-lighting of 'love'.

I rarely read about the power of love in education writers.

Do we hardly mention loving-kindness in our training of teachers?

But I identify first with the motivating energy of 'agape', and secondly with the power of steadfast love in our teaching in schools and in higher education. 'Chesed' is rarely mentioned: (steadfast love for our organisation as managers, loving-kindness motivating our pastoral care of students, our love for learning, and care about student needs). 'Shalom' is a lovely word 'wholeness', 'health' and human flourishing' powered by love.

Thank you, and warm wishes for your future work Catherine.

Brian

I began this presentation with references to the legitimation of the knowledge created by practitioner researchers and staff associated with Bath Spa University. I shall finish by referring to the work of the 5X5X5 arts based action research project supported by the University with Penny Hay as Director of Research. You can access details of this project at:

<http://www.5x5x5creativity.org.uk/>

In 5x5x5, the process, rather than the end product, is always the main focus - 'we are researching the children researching the world'. Children are given the opportunity to explore their own themes and questions and encouraged to create their own lines of enquiry. Thorough documentation of the children's thoughts, feelings and ideas forms the basis of projects: responsive planning is used to develop and pursue further ideas. Adults and children are involved in recording and

reflecting on the children's learning through written observations, photos and video. It is usually parents who join in to help document and their role is crucial as a partner in the research, working alongside the children, artists, teachers and cultural centres.....

Over the last ten years 5x5x5=creativity has evolved to support children and young people in this way. Our research findings demonstrate the value of fostering creative enquiry by empowering children to take the lead as they explore the world around them and discover the joys of proactive learning. They emerge notably more confident, with enhanced self-esteem - better able to engage, express themselves and problem solve. These capacities of curiosity, investigation and communicating with others in many ways are foundations for life-long learning. We have to find ways to support all children, as they grow into independent, enquiring and creative people.

At its heart is the belief that all children have the potential to develop their creativity, no matter what their background and circumstances. Through their involvement in 5x5x5, children are able to develop their creativity and become confident, creative learners in every aspect throughout their lives.

I am finishing this presentation on multi-media narratives for research into the influences of educational leadership and professional learning with an implication of the quotation from 5X5X5:

Adults and children are involved in recording and reflecting on the children's learning through written observations, photos and video. It is usually parents who join in to help document and their role is crucial as a partner in the research, working alongside the children, artists, teachers and cultural centres.....,

I am suggesting that researchers at Bath Spa University could be leading the field in the generation of educational knowledge by researching their educational leadership and professional learning as they explain their educational influences in forming and sustaining the approaches to learning being pioneered by parents, pupils, artists, teachers and cultural centres in 5X5X5. The 5X5X5 Conference on the 15th July, details below, could provide documentation on the significance of bringing into the public domain the embodied knowledge of these practitioners in an arts based action research project with staff at Bath Spa University.

Michael Tippett Centre
Bath Spa University
Newton Park
Bath BA2 9BN

Bath Spa University in partnership with 5x5x5-creativity
supported by Creativity, Culture and Education (CCE)

Creativity Conference 2011 Shaping the Future

Friday 15 July 9.30am-4.30pm

Shaping the Future: a conference for all concerned about the future of our young people's creative education.

Do you want to do any of the following?
Transform your curriculum and put creative learning at the centre
See how creativity can also raise standards
Teach more creatively so your students can learn more creatively
Share how creativity can support wellbeing and self-esteem
Develop creative and reflective learning environments

Then this is the conference for you
 The importance of creative learning is even more vital in our current educational climate. Many schools are now developing more creative, contemporary learning contexts for their students. We plan to offer a forum for participants to collaborate, network and seek out each other's creative action and learning. The day will enable people directly involved in working with children and

young people to identify their own capacity to effect positive and creative change.

Shaping the Future
 is a conference for strategy leaders, head teachers, artists, teachers, cultural organisations, parents and others interested in exploring the belief in children's and young people's creative capacities. The conference and workshops will enable you to reflect upon and commit to shaping the future direction of learning and teaching that meets the needs of our young people's creativity.

Keynote speakers
 will address topics including creative values, transformation and the nature of creativity. Speakers include Andrea Sully, Marcus Orlovsky, Professor Anna Craft, Joe Hallgarten and Douglas Archibald. We will showcase examples of creative practice from national and regional initiatives including:

- 5x5x5creativity: Schools of Transformation
- CCE: Schools of Creativity
- Bath Spa University projects
- Bath Festivals Write Team
- 5x5x5-creativity: AND
- Thrift
- Creative Learning Agency
- Art and Power
- The egg theatre
- Earlyarts
- Eastfeast
- Cape UK
- Sightlines Initiative
- Ignite
- Whole Education
- The Curriculum Foundation

Cost - including lunch & refreshments: £125 Retocus members: £110 Concessions (artists and students): £55

Conference Programme	
9.00 Registration and coffee	1.00 Lunch, exhibitions, bookshop, egg theatre special guests
9.30 Welcome: Stephen Ward Dean of School of Education, Bath Spa University	2.00 Parallel presentations/workshops
Chair: Penny Hay Director of 5x5x5creativity and Senior Lecturer in Arts Education, Bath Spa University	• CCE Schools of Creativity
9.45 Thought piece: Andrea Sully, Senior Adviser, North Somerset	• 5x5x5-creativity: AND artist network development
10.00 Keynote: Marcus Orlovsky, Curriculum Foundation, Daring to Dream. Response, questions and discussion	• Ignite
11.15 Coffee	• Earlyarts
11.45 Parallel presentations/workshops	• Cape UK
• 5x5x5creativity Schools of Transformation	• Art and Power
• Eastfeast	• Whole Education
• Bath Spa University projects	3.15 Tea
• Bath Festivals Write Team	3.30 Thought piece: Professor Anna Craft Exeter and Open University, Patron of 5x5x5creativity
• Sightlines Initiative	3.42 Panel:
• Thrift	Joe Hallgarten, Director CCE; Douglas Archibald, Director, Whole Education, Sally Jackson, Early Years Manager Bristol, 5x5x5-creativity Trustee
• The Curriculum Foundation	4.15 Response: Simon Jutton, Arts Council England

Booking form

Name(s) _____
 Position _____
 Organisation _____
 Address _____

 Postcode _____
 Tel: _____
 Email: _____

Please reserve me _____ place(s)
 I/we wish to attend the seminar
 and enclose a cheque for _____
 per person.

Cheques should be made
 payable to 5x5x5-creativity.
 Please send completed form
 and payment to:

Julia Butler
 Research Coordinator
 5x5x5-creativity
 PO Box 3236
 Chippenham
 SN15 9DE
julia@5x5x5creativity.org.uk

As I said at the beginning I want to repeat my thanks to Steve Coombs and the organizers for the pleasure you have evoked in me as I continue to work at living as fully as I can the energy and values that constitute my vocation for education. Thankyou.

References

- Bath Spa University (2009) *Professional Masters Programme Generic Student Handbook*. Bath; Bath Spa University.
- Bernstein, R. (1971) *Praxis and Action*. London; Duckworth.
- Collingwood, R. G. (1991) *An Autobiography*, Oxford; Oxford University Press
- Fromm, E. (1980) *The Heart Of Man: Its Genius for Good and Evil*. Second Edition. London; Harper Colophon Books.
- Habermas, J. (1976) *Communication and the evolution of society*. London : Heinemann.
- Hirst, P. (Ed.) (1983) *Educational Theory and its Foundation Disciplines*. London;RKP.
- Huxtable, M. (2009) How do we contribute to an educational knowledge base? A response to Whitehead and a challenge to BERJ. *Research Intelligence*, 107, 25-26. Retrieved 11 January 2010 from <http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/huxtable/mh2009beraRI107.pdf>
- MacLure, M. (1996) Telling Transitions: Boundary Work in Narratives of Becoming an Action Researcher. *British Educational Research Journal*, 22(3); 273-286.
- McTaggart, R. (1992) Reductionism and Action Research: Technology versus convivial forms of life, pp. 47-61 in Bruce, C. S. & Russell, A. L. (1992) *Transforming Tomorrow Today*. Brisbane, University of Queensland, Australia.
- Potts, M. (2004) *How can I improve my practice by communicating more effectively with others in my role as a professional educator?* MA Dissertation, University of Bath. Retrieved 070611 from <http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/monday/mpmadis.pdf>
- Rayner, A. (2011) Space Cannot be Cut – Why Self-Identity Naturally Includes Neighbourhood, *Journal of Integrative Psychology and Behavioural Science*, 45:161-184.

Schön, D. (1995) 'The New Scholarship Requires A New Epistemology', in *Change*, November/December 27(6); 27–34.

Whitehead, J. (2008). *How Can I~We Create Living Educational Theories From Research Into Professional Learning?* Paper presented in the Symposium convened by Jean McNiff on Communicating and testing the validity of claims to transformational systemic influence for civic responsibility, at AERA, New York, USA. Retrieved from <http://www.jackwhitehead.com/jack/jwaera08jmsem.htm>

Whitehead, J. & Rayner, A. (2009) *From Dialectics to Inclusivity: A naturally inclusive approach to educational accountability*. Retrieved 7 June 2011 from <http://www.actionresearch.net/writings/jack/arjwdialtoIncl061109.pdf>