

## **Chapter 5 – Findings**

### **5.1 Introduction**

In this chapter some of the research sub-questions are addressed using the emergent findings from analysis of the data that has been gathered. The research questions are used as a focus for synthesising the findings. The emergent findings from the analysis of video data in the previous chapter are brought together with findings from further analysis contained in Appendix N and with evidence from other sources (emails, letters, photographs, diary extracts). This systematic analysis leads to emergent themes which address some of the research sub- questions, which in turn help to address the overarching research question:

*How can I reconceptualise international educational partnerships as a form of ‘Living Citizenship’?*

In Section 5.4, there is an explanation of the post-qualitative checks that are carried out to test the validity of the responses to the questions and also to try to answer the research questions more fully.

### **5.2 Data Gathered for Analysis and Synthesis**

An extensive amount of data has been gathered over a ten year period from 2000-2010. This takes the form of:

- Eight extended interviews with participants in the partnership held during reciprocal visits between the Schools. This includes an interview with the Headteacher of the South African School, an interview with the School Pupil President, interviews with members of staff in both

schools, and an interview with a recipient of a bursary provided by Salisbury High School. Details of all of these interviews are provided in the previous chapter (Section 4.3.3) and in Appendices B and N.

These are interviews that include pre-planned questions and they are captured on video.

- Interviews with 5 students from the South African school before visiting the UK and again after their visit. (See figures Bi, pB23 and Ne, pN10) and interviews with 5 students from Salisbury High School who had participated in activities during the visit of the South African students. (See figure Nd, pN6). These interviews were done to ascertain their learning from the partnership activities and again they were captured on video.
- Four hours of video taped footage from reciprocal visits. UK participants have visited the South African School four times and South African participants have visited the UK School three times. The video footage includes lessons, Assemblies, speeches and curriculum activities engaged in by participants in the partnership. (See figures 4m, Bb,pB5 Bd, pB12 Bf,Bg and Bh, PpB17-B23) Some of this footage was pre-planned and some of it was captured because the researcher recognised the learning potential of the activity.
- Responses of the UK participants at the end of their visit to South Africa in 2005. (See Appendix E)
- Four DVDs capturing the curriculum projects, classroom activities, Assemblies and community activities that have been engaged in during the exchange visits between the participants in the partnership.

- A reflective diary, video footage and written commentary, kept by the researcher over the period 2000-2010. (See Appendix A)
- Emails, photographs and letters from participants. (See Appendices F to L)
- Two interviews with participants conducted towards the end of the research project to act as corroborative checks and to ascertain long-term impact (See sections 5.4.1.2 and 5.4.1.3).
- Two hours of peer review activity captured on video where critical friends have looked at data presented by the researcher and commented on the validity of the interpretation of the data given by the researcher. This was done as a post-qualitative check and detail is provided in section 5.4.

This range of data enables a synthesis of evidence to address the research questions and provides a means of validation to further strengthen the resultant findings. Much of this data has been analysed using the methods described in detail and exemplified in chapter 4. The Talkback procedure, first devised by Coombs (1995) and adapted by Potts and Coombs (2009) for this project was used again to analyse video footage of interviews with students and staff of both schools during the South Africans visit to Salisbury in 2007. This visit reciprocated the visit by UK participants to South Africa and the data is analysed to check the reliability of the emergent findings from the analysis carried out in chapter 4. The analysis tables are included as Appendix N. These two sets of findings (chapter 4 and Appendix N) are used together with

the findings from analysis of the other data sources to produce a set of valid resultant findings that can be turned into conclusions and recommendations.

The data is gathered over a ten year period of research. The research methods, such as the gathering of video data and systematic analysis of it, have been repeated. This process is part of the action research approach adopted by the researcher, whereby cycles of research are conducted (See section 3.2.7) in order to check out previous findings and to address new questions that arise.

### **5.3 Emergent Themes**

The evidence for each of the first three research sub-questions is now examined to see what themes emerge from it.

#### **5.3.1 Values at the Heart of the Partnership**

Research Question 1 – To what extent have the values of social justice, equal opportunities and Ubuntu been put at the heart of the international partnership between the schools? To what extent have shared values and a shared language for expressing these values been developed in establishing the partnership?

This is a key research issue because values underpin the assumptions made when forming educational policy and practice. Making the values of the partnership explicit makes the assumptions behind any recommendations for educational policy and practice to improve citizenship education clear. In Chapters two and three the zulu value of Ubuntu (humanity) (See section

2.3.2), social justice, equality of opportunity (See section 2.3.3), participation and democracy (See section 3.3.3) were identified by the researcher as being of worth to him and as crucial parts of citizenship education. It was anticipated that the partnership would provide the potential for participants to live out these values and develop them as part of the action research social change through the activities of the partnership. Thus the researcher recognised the potential of the partnership to act as an agent of change (See section 2.4.4) through the transmission of values. In this first section of the findings the evidence concerning the extent to which each of these values has been put at the heart of the partnership is set out. This can then be used as a means to evaluate the success of the partnership as a means of delivering social change through the identification of new values and educational cultural approaches using an action research approach. The first value considered is Ubuntu.

#### 5.3.1.1 Getting the Ubuntu Going

The question addressed here is: To what extent is Ubuntu at the heart of the partnership? Ubuntu is that sense of togetherness (Whitehead, 2004) and humaneness (Hughes, 2005), which is transferable across national boundaries and can bring together the two communities in Salisbury and Durban.

There is evidence to suggest in the use of language that some of the participants are beginning to use the same language to identify Ubuntu as one of the core values in the partnership. These quotes from the analysis of the

video footage outlined in chapter 4 show evidence of the development of this shared language;

**Figure 5a – Developing a shared language**

Rose Miyakho – “What you are doing guys, it’s more than Ubuntu and I don’t know how much to thank you.” (Appendix B, figure Ba, pB2)

My Speech – “Our partnership is based on the principle of *umuntu, umuntu, ugabantu*, which in English means, a person is a person through other persons.” (Appendix B, figure Bd, pB13)

My Speech – “It’s also about friendship, building bridges between communities. It’s about Ubuntu and the idea of humanity, we are all together as human beings But mostly I think it’s about learning, it’s about us learning from you and about you learning from us.” (Appendix B, figure Bd, pB13)

Mr Ngobo – “May the spirit of togetherness, the spirit of ubuntu, the love and the appreciation thrive between us.” (Appendix B, figure Bg, pB21)

The phrase *umuntu ngumuntu ngabantu* is used by the researcher to describe the core values of the partnership in his speech to the South African School Assembly and this is greeted with delight by the students and staff.

Mr Ngobo in his speech uses the term “love” to describe the relationship between our communities, alongside reference to the notion of Ubuntu. He also uses the phrase “appreciation”. This could be a description of the mutual respect the participants have for each other.

It is also evident in the fax from Mr Shezi, the Headteacher of Nqabakazulu School, in his words describing our actions in funding the students through their first year of University, *“R12000 will be distributed among 4 learners, 2 girls and 2 boys. It will come in handy for their registrations.”* (Appendix C, pC1) This will enable more young people to access higher education and give them the opportunity to improve the quality of life for themselves, their families and their communities. The Headteacher goes on to say in his fax (Appendix C).

*“Last years’ recipients are progressing well. They are always close to the School, and are serving as role models and motivators to our learners. All of them are from struggling families. So you did UBUNTU by making them realise their dreams. It was an act of HUMANITY. To assist the poor of the poorest. It is an upliftment exercise. BLESSED IS THE HAND THAT GIVETH!!!”* (p. C1)

This from the Headteacher, who himself is a Zulu, gives validity to the claim that the activities of the partnership are in embedding the value of Ubuntu.

The Government Gazette (1996) describes Ubuntu as meaning “that people are people through other people. It also acknowledges both the rights and the responsibilities of every citizen in promoting individual and societal well-being.” There is much evidence from the study that the participants from both the South African and the UK School and community are acknowledging their responsibility as citizens to promote individual and societal well-being. Mr

Ngobo says, “You have reached out to our community” (Appendix B, figure Bg, pB21) The students and staff act as friends to the visitors from each country, The participants talk about their experience of friendship. Thus the South African students are able to say after their visit to Salisbury High School “The children are very friendly and I did not expect that because of our colour” (Appendix N, figure Ne, pN11) and the visiting teacher says, “Most students were very friendly towards us. Some went the extra mile and were like brothers and sisters to us” (Appendix N, Nf, pN15). Cath (Chapter 4, figure 4k, memo 1) talks about how the students from Salisbury High School visiting Nqabakazulu School and visits from Nqabakazulu School students and staff to the UK have provided personal contact with people of a different culture allowing personal relationships and friendships to develop. This “*cross-cultural pollination*” (Appendix B, figure Bb, pB6) as witnessed by Mr Shezi, the Headteacher of Nqabakazulu School, has enriched Salisbury High School and has helped to produce students who are more aware of their responsibilities as global citizens. They have demonstrated through their actions, examined later in section 5.3.3 of this chapter, that their hearts have been “touched” by the situation faced by the School community in Kwamashu. The Salisbury High School participants are living out their values of Ubuntu and social justice by seeking to provide more equal opportunities through fundraising and by engaging in friendship with the Nqabakazulu School participants.

This evidence suggesting that Ubuntu is at the heart of our partnership is triangulated with these two extracts from the researcher’s reflective diary:



Figure 5b

### **Connecting With Other Human Beings – An Example of Ubuntu**

#### **Video of art work and girl singing at farewell ceremony (Potts 2005)**

As I look at the video that I made of our schools first visit to Nqabakazulu School in 2005, I see evidence of getting the Ubuntu going (Hughes 2005), through the pictures of the art work showing the collaboration between my School and Nqabakazulu School, through the beautiful singing of the girl with the microphone and the swaying rhythmic movements of her classmates at the farewell ceremony and through the wild cheers as the zulu dance group begin their performance. I want to focus on the singing part of the farewell ceremony to illustrate the notion of Ubuntu.

What I see in this video clip is a young girl leading the singing, her classmates swaying and joining in with the harmony. There is a total absorption of those around her in the rhythm of the music. Our group of 17 visitors is totally captivated by the music. As the girl sings people are preparing for the farewell ceremony. This is essentially the warm-up act. They are getting the Ubuntu going in a very natural way, through music and dance. The Ubuntu is that togetherness, the recognition of individuals' humanity (Whitehead, 2004), that the music generates for all those who are present. It captivates and encourages participation in the event at whatever level, be it singing, swaying, humming or listening. It carries a strong emotional appeal. And now as I look at the video again, it brings back that sense of Ubuntu, of togetherness, that binds us as human beings across the world (South African Government Gazette, 1996). For me Ubuntu describes that feeling better than any other word in my vocabulary.

In figure 5b above the researcher shows how he is trying to understand the culturally specific notion of “Getting the Ubuntu going” by interpreting a scene at a farewell ceremony at the South African captured by him on video.

This second extract from the reflective diary illustrates the researcher sharing the notion of Ubuntu with the students of Salisbury High School through an Assembly. The use of video footage as well as words is designed to engage the students.

Figure 5c

### **Assembly on Values**

I delivered this Assembly the week before the visit of the South Africans in May 2009. In it I talked about the values of Salisbury High School and the values of the partnership. I identified three core values for the partnership: equal opportunities; social justice and Ubuntu. I went on to explain what I think Ubuntu is and how it describes the relationship between the partner schools. I showed the video clip of the Art work produced by Nqabakazulu School students working with our own students and the Nqabakazulu school girl singing to exemplify “Getting the Ubuntu going”.

I also used the story of Lunga to exemplify us living out our values more fully. The efforts of Aurore and of all of the students who contributed towards funding Lunga’s education, many of whom were sitting in my audience at the Assembly, illustrated the values of equal opportunities, social justice and

Ubuntu. I was able to show them the fruits of their efforts with a video clip of an interview conducted with Lunga by Bob Ainsworth during his visit to the School in February 2009. This gave the students and staff of Salisbury High School some feedback on how their fundraising efforts had changed the life of Lunga, so that he now has a bright future ahead of him. This is a good example of how we can live out our values more fully by helping others less fortunate than ourselves.

(Appendix A, Pp A28-A29)

In order to check these interpretations of Ubuntu video footage of part of the speech by Rose (Appendix B, figure Ba, Pp. B1-B5) was shown to the peer review group. The group was given the definitions of Ubuntu as shown in Chapter two (Section 2.3.2) and they were asked for their comments on the footage regarding Ubuntu. The ensuing discussion was captured on video and is included as Appendix R, section R.1. The first response was from a member of the group who asked how the video clips might illustrate a sense of togetherness or shared humanity in the face of a power disparity (between northern and southern countries). The researcher pointed to the use of oral language and the use of body language in the clip. Rose says in the clip “*You guys are angels*” and in emails she has referred to the UK participants as family. This use of such language feels like Ubuntu. In terms of body language, in the clip Rose comes across as a very warm person, she smiles a great deal and her tone of voice is very warm. Another member of the group suggests that, “*when the personal relationship between people is (strong) the*

*power disparity dissipates....and when you get to know someone better there is more common understanding”.*

*A third member of the group says, “I think the video clip does show a sense of Ubuntu in the level of social interaction between you, the fact that Rose is actually taking the lead and is clearly empowered by the role that she has. I think it would be good to find clips that do evidence parts of the partnership that have been initiated by the South Africans themselves.”*

(Appendix R, Section R1)

The evidence shows that several participants are using the phrase Ubuntu to describe the impact of the partnership activities. Thus, Ubuntu emerges as a central value that is at the heart of the partnership and a value that participants have come to share.

#### 5.3.1.2 Equality of Opportunity and Social Justice

Two other values that were proposed as being central to the partnership were equality of opportunity and social justice (See section 2.3.3). The research question seeks to address the extent to which these values have become central to the partnership.

##### *a) Providing a Context for Learning*

At the same time as recognition of the connectedness of participants in the partnership (Ubuntu), there is also recognition of the differences in terms of the economic and social circumstances that the participants in the partnership face. There is frequent reference by participants to different resource

provision in the two schools and to different health and social situations in the two communities. Lunga says in his interview, *“If I get the opportunity to complete my degree and to work, it will bring (provide) bread at home”* (Chapter 4, figure 4f). In an interview Siyabonga talks about the impact that the bursaries are having on the recipients. They are providing them with hope and enabling them to escape the poverty of their surroundings (Appendix O)

In the interview with him we hear Siyabonga eloquently describe the social background of the “learners” (students) at his school. It is not only the words that express his humility and commitment to those less fortunate than himself, it is the way that he expresses himself. He shines as if his soul is bursting through as he responds to my question about the lives of the students at the School:

*“Some of the learners’ lives are very difficult. I’m sure you have seen some of the homes, the shacks where they live. Last year I and my committee with the help of the teachers started a feeding scheme because some of the learners find that they come to School without anything to eat and the whole day there is nothing for them to eat. We are trying to organise something and we also got help from some other organisations and we are hoping to continue that system. But to be truthful, lives of the learners at this School at home are difficult. I have to take care of my young sisters and young brothers. I have to make sure that there is food for them to eat. I have to make sure that they get water and whatever they need just to survive. It is very difficult”*

(Siyabonga 2005, Appendix O, play time 10.20)

It is the recognition of these differences, then consideration of how to tackle them and action to do so that promotes the values of social justice and equal opportunities within the partnership. Thus the international partnership becomes a vehicle for delivering education about these issues. Striving to promote these values is part of the social manifesto (Coombs, 2005) and getting participants to adopt and live out these values was a key aim of the project. Put another way, in the words of Whitehead (2005), this educational partnership seeks through these values to influence social formations. Evidence of how participants have lived out these values is provided later in this chapter in section 5.3.3.3.

*b) Developing a Sense of Injustice*

It is evident from the visits to Nqabakazulu School and the video footage that is shown to students and staff in the UK that there is inequality of opportunity. Evidence shows that it is an impression that is left when people have visited South Africa, or when they have watched the researcher's video footage. Cath's comments on the inequality of opportunity between the two schools (Chapter 4, section 4.5.1.2, figure 4m, memo 1) indicate this. In the Assembly she contrasts the situation regarding practical work in the two Schools. She highlights for our students how frequently they get to do practical work in School. The lack of resources for the South African School inhibits practical work and necessitates a more teacher-led approach to learning.

The following comments from pupils at Salisbury High School also indicate that they are left with the impression of differences between the schools:

*“It is very different to our School”*

*“The teachers are paid low salaries”*

*“Children have to walk a long way to School”*

*“They don’t do as many subjects as us, like PE and ICT”*

(Appendix N, figure Nd, Pp N8-N9)

This also highlights this inequality when talking about the opportunities that the partnership is providing, he talks about giving the *“poorest of the poor an opportunity to see how other people live, inculcating them with the motivation and drive to really progress in life”*. (Appendix B, figure Be, pB15)

This extract from the interview with Siyabonga, the School President, illustrates the financial difficulties and lack of opportunity facing the pupils in the South African School. (Appendix O, play time 11.30)

Researcher – *What are the hopes and dreams of these learners? What would they love to do?*

Siyabonga – *We have come from apartheid. Now it is a free country and we are celebrating ten years of democracy. We have the chance of developing our lives and to see other people develop their lives. Most of the learners, their hope is to get a good education, to get a good job and perhaps one day to have a big house, a car, a wife and children and such things.*

Researcher – *So escape the poverty, the Aids problem?*

Siyabonga – *Escape the poverty, yah.*

Researcher – *What can we do to help the learners from this School to realise some of their hopes and dreams? Can we help in any way? What do you think?*

Siyabonga – *I think you can help. The help that you have just offered, offering two bursaries for learners, I think it's great. I always say that if out of five learners, if two learners or three learners get successful or achieve their goals that will make a huge difference in their lives and in the life of South Africa as well, because they will be able to help other pupils. If you would try and help some more learners, especially because the huge problem that there is here is financial. There are a lot of learners who would like to continue their education, but find that after matric. (matriculation) they have to stay at home, there is nothing to do.*

As the Toolkit produced by the United Kingdom One World Linking Association (UKOWLA) says: *“Linking can raise awareness of issues and injustice and inequality on a scale to which we can relate and understand.”* ([www.ukowla.org.uk](http://www.ukowla.org.uk) Toolkit 7b, Para 3)

Goffman (1974) and Snow and Benford (1988) talk about the conditions for frame alignment, the alignment of people behind a cause, to lead to social movement or change. One of those conditions is that the cause needs to chime with other people's agendas for change. Nationally there are several movements that are promoting the cause of improving social justice and equal opportunity as this extract from the researcher's diary shows:



Figure 5d – **Extract from Reflective diary** (Appendix A)

As I focus my attention on developing and strengthening the link with the South African school, there is a synchronicity with the focus of the world on Africa. It is June 2005 and Bob Geldof has announced the second concert for Africa. This will be called Live 8 and will be designed to *“create domestic political heat in each of the G8 countries, aimed at forcing world leaders to drop third-world debt, reform trade laws and double aid to the region.”*

(Geldof, 2005) As he announces this concert and its intentions I listen with a sympathetic ear to the sentiments that he eloquently expresses. Sir Elton John and Harvey Goldsmith speak and struggle to contain their emotions as I do when I speak on such subjects. It appears to me that my generation in particular is committed to eradicating this great injustice. We have had to live with it for too long and it will be our gift to humanity to get rid of it. My work to sustain the link with Nqabakazulu School and to make a difference to the lives of people in the black township is a small part of a much bigger movement to change lives.

Over the next few weeks there is a great deal of press coverage of the issues to do with poverty in Africa. The Chancellor, Gordon Brown meets with the G7 leaders and gains agreement to write off £30 billion worth of debt:

*“Eighteen of the world’s poorest countries will have their debts to the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund wiped out as part of a \$55bn*

*(£30.4bn) package agreed today by the G7 leading economies”* (Guardian Newspaper, 2005)

As well as debt relief there is a strong push to increase aid to African countries and to improve the terms of trade for African countries. The difficulties faced by African farmers are illustrated very effectively by the Independent newspaper headline on Saturday 3<sup>rd</sup> June.

*“How the US is stitching up Africa (and British consumers reap the benefits)”*  
(Frith, 2005)

This article highlights the subsidies given by the US government to cotton farmers in the USA. According to the article, the annual subsidy amounts to \$3.9bn. This is having a dramatic impact on cotton farmers in poorer African countries as they are unable to compete with the subsidised price from the USA. As a result of this policy thousands of cotton farmers in poorer countries are going out of business and poverty is growing as GDP falls. The article highlights the problems faced by farmers in Benin. The price of clothing in the UK has fallen as a result of the subsidies but at a cost to the livelihoods of farmers in countries like Benin. Rightly, many campaigners are focussing on the need to reform trade to give African countries an economic advantage over more economically developed countries.

This national debate about how to help relieve African poverty is helpful in raising the awareness of the students and teachers about the issues. It gives

me the opportunity to link international events with our own work in School. Our Staff Briefing each Monday morning is an opportunity to make announcements to all staff. On Monday 13<sup>th</sup> June I am able to make the following announcement:

"Gordon Brown has just got the leaders of the G7 countries to agree to wipe out £30billion of debt to poor countries. Now is your chance to do your bit to improve lives in Africa. Like Live 8 we are trying to move forward on several fronts. We want to continue supporting two students per year from Nqabakazulu School through their first year of University, we want to bring some of the students and staff to visit us here at Westwood and we want to raise money to help them to build a School Hall. A simple way to contribute is to sponsor a participant in the sponsored walk on Thursday 30<sup>th</sup> June. If you have not done so yet, then my form is here, please add your name to my list of sponsors." (Potts, 2005)

Thus there is plenty of evidence to suggest that people and governments are willing to support projects that contribute to the social manifesto improvement agenda and take actions as active citizens that lead to improvements in the lives of people in Africa and try to redress the injustice that exists. However, the aims of this support, particularly from some governments, may not always be the same as mine, seeking to live out my beliefs in social justice and humanity more fully.

(Appendix A, Section A.5 Pp. A14 – A17)

The evidence suggests that the partnership provided a means of raising awareness for participants on a personal level, on a scale to which they could relate and understand. At the same time it was helpful in mobilizing the participants to act that these issues were also gaining a great deal of media coverage.

#### 5.3.1.3 Summary of Findings in Response to Research Question 1

Research Question 1 – To what extent have the values of social justice, equal opportunities and Ubuntu been put at the heart of the international partnership between the schools? To what extent have shared values and a shared language for expressing these values been developed in establishing the partnership?

The evidence for the development of a shared language being used by participants is presented in section 5.3.1.1 above. It became evident to the researcher that a shared language had developed to describe the values that underpin the international partnership when in June 2008 the researcher was asked by Rose to write a speech that would be delivered at an opening ceremony for some new buildings for the School. This was to be a major event featuring various national and regional government officials and great preparations were made. They were expecting 3000 people to attend the ceremony, including the students, staff, Governors, parents, officials. The researcher emailed the following speech to her:

Figure 5e

**Speech at Nqabakazulu School** (Appendix H)

*I am proud to be invited to address the assembled dignitaries, teachers and students at Nqabakazulu School on the official opening of the School. I speak as your friend and partner in the spirit of Ubuntu and as the representative of your partner school in the United Kingdom, Salisbury High School. On the several occasions that we have visited you in Kwamashu we have been overwhelmed by your friendship and humanity in welcoming us. We recognise your loving spirit as it flows in to our hearts and enriches our learning. Our actions in partnership are devoted to furthering the cause of social justice and humanity. We recognise the steps that we in partnership have already taken and the potential for further actions to develop these beliefs. I throw out this question to all those assembled, how are you working in partnership with the School to further the causes of social justice and humanity? We at Salisbury High School are proud to partner Nqabakazulu School with its dedicated staff and hardworking students. I offer these words in the Zulu spirit of Ubuntu that we have learned from you. My love and best wishes.*

*Mark Potts*

*Deputy Headteacher*

Email sent on June 1<sup>st</sup> 2008

This email shows the researcher using the shared language that has developed through the partnership. The researcher shows what he has learned as he becomes more fluent in articulating the values that underpin the partnership and that provide the driving force behind it. He has learned a great deal about his own values and the importance of them in influencing his own actions.

In the interview with Cath she identified that the researcher has been a "lead person" in the partnership, somebody who sustains the partnership by "keeping the momentum going". She talks about the researcher's role in "motivating and involving people" and "keeping the students involved". (Chapter 4, figure 4k, memo 4). The researcher certainly sees the values of Ubuntu, social justice and equal opportunities as central to the partnership and as motivators for his actions in developing the partnership.

The values that have emerged have done so through dialogue. The dialogues that have been established by the participants to shape the values are outlined in chapter 3, section 3.3.3 in figure 3d. This wide range of dialogues has led to the development of the shared language of socio-educational values underpinning a shared vision for the partnership.

It has been established by the evidence reviewed above that the values of Ubuntu (humanity), equality of opportunity and social justice have been central to the partnership between Salisbury High School and Nqabakazulu School in South Africa and that an international partnership is capable of providing a pedagogical platform for the delivery of these aspects of citizenship education. What has also been demonstrated so far, to a limited extent, is that participants in the partnership can be influenced to change the way that they live their lives because of their experiences of the activities of the partnership. Further evidence of this is presented later in this chapter in section 5.3.3.

### **5.3.2 Extending Participation and Democracy Through the Conduct of the Research Project**

Research Question 2 - To what extent has the researcher encouraged participation and democracy through his actions in establishing, developing and sustaining the partnership?

#### 5.3.2.1 Introduction

The importance of increasing participation and democracy through research (Reason, 2005) was discussed in section 3.3.3. In order to bring in the voices of others to the narrative and show their learning, the researcher is aware of the importance of being democratic in his approach to the partnership.

He is mindful of the importance of modelling democratic values and practices in the organisation of activities related to the international partnership. For, according to Gearon (2003), those schools that model democratic values and practices, and encourage students to discuss issues in the classroom and take an active role in the life of the school, are most effective in promoting civic knowledge and engagement. Engagement in the activities of the partnership is what is required.

In this section the researcher provides evidence to suggest that a democratic approach has been followed as a means of extending participation in the partnership and that democratic practices have been modelled in developing the partnership.

### 5.3.2.2 Extending Participation in the Partnership as it Developed

From the start of the partnership the researcher recognised the importance of extending participation in the partnership. Thus the researcher's diary entry for 2002 says, *"The next phase in the development was to involve more people in the link in order to sustain it. This would be useful if either I, or my colleague Thiris in South Africa, left our respective schools"*. (Appendix A, Section A.2, pA4)

#### *a) The Early Years*

Fundraising events in 2002 had provided a continuing focus on the link between the schools and this was further strengthened by a teacher exchange paid for by the British Council. Firstly, in February 2003, one of the UK teachers visited South Africa and Nqabakazulu School and then in the summer of the same year, Thiris came over from South Africa and worked with the students at Salisbury High School. Thiris' visit gave a physical representation to the link between the schools. He was able to answer the students' questions and satisfy their curiosity about South Africa and the lives of the students at Nqabakazulu School. This played a major part in embedding the partnership.

It was at this time that the researcher's wife suggested that the funds raised be used to provide bursaries for students to go in to their first year of University. When this suggestion was put to Thiris he thought it an excellent way to direct fundraising efforts. The idea of bursaries to provide some of the Nqabakazulu students with a real chance of realising their hopes of escaping



from poverty captured the imagination of students and staff at Salisbury High School. By December 2004, £2800 had been raised through various activities. This was sufficient to pay for some Nqabakazulu students to go to University for a year. In the second and third year of their studies at University these students, assuming they were successful in their studies, would be able to access government grants to support them.

*b) Organising a Visit from Salisbury High School*

A key learning episode for participants and a key point in the development of the partnership was the first UK group visit to South Africa in 2005.

*“Commitment to positive action to break down barriers of class, race and religion by bringing together learners of different class, race and religion in purposeful activities” (CSCS, 2005; P2)*

This from the Centre for Supporting Comprehensive Education in the UK sums up the value that drove the researcher to set about organising a visit for staff colleagues and students to South Africa.

What follows is a series of diary entries made by the researcher which provide an account of the events leading up to the visit and show how he has encouraged participation in the activities of the partnership.

**Figure 5f Diary entries**

The fundraising done for a time, I began organising a visit to South Africa in January 2004. I advertised the trip around the School and our party grew to 17. This comprised myself and my wife, my son and daughter, the Head of Humanities and her two daughters, the Head of Modern Foreign Languages, eight students and one parent. For each person this was a big emotional and financial commitment. They were set to raise a target amount of £1000 each to pay for the trip. For many of the students this meant working extra hours in their part-time jobs and forgoing some of the alternatives of teenage life.

I arranged regular meetings to focus the group on the reasons for our visit and to organise the itinerary. During these meetings we discussed how we would spend our time in South Africa and we agreed a proposed itinerary between us. One of the planning meetings was a gathering at our house when we all met and decided on activities to run at Nqabakazulu School during the three days that we were spending at the School. We settled on three distinct groups, one to teach art, one to teach music and one to teach sports.

The itinerary had to be negotiated with Thiris, our contact in South Africa and a teacher at Nqabakazulu School. He had to liaise with the School on how best to use us. With only a few days to go to our flight the itinerary was finally settled.

I was conscious of preparing the members of the group as well as I could. The heat, the culture, the otherness of Africa can be overwhelming. I tried to give a flavour of what it would be like by showing the video that I took when I visited

in February 2002 and providing a commentary on it. I did this at an evening that I arranged for all the parents of the students. During meetings much of our discussion was about the precautions to take in order to avoid illness. The three teachers did a thorough risk assessment together and this was shared with the group and the parents. There was a great buzz about the meetings, especially as the departure approached. Excitement was building as our plans were about to be brought to fruition.

(Appendix A, Section A.3, Pp A5-A6)

During the visit the researcher was continuing to consider how participation in the partnership could be extended in both communities as this further extract from his diary shows:

*There is a sense in which all this good work can be wasted unless further actions emerge from it. Whilst in the School I met with the Headteacher, staff and students to discuss how we could best support the school. What was clear was that they were searching for ways to gain financial support but there was a limit on the assistance that they can call on from both the local community and the government due to limited funds. Many of the School's parents find it difficult to pay the low school fees and they do not have additional funds to call upon to support the school. Therefore we must do what we can to provide financial assistance. I realised that the next steps are down to me. (Appendix A, pA9)*

*c) Extending Participation After the Visit*

Again after the visit, reflection on how to extend participation and how to develop the activities of the partnership continued as this diary entry shows:

*“The journey home and period of rest immediately afterwards provided plenty of time to reflect on how the partnership could be taken forward from this point. There were some actions that could be taken within the next few days. One of these was to get together the members of the group that had visited South Africa for a sharing of the experiences and a reflection on the meaning of the trip for each of them. A week later the group gathered at the researcher’s house for some food and discussion. Photographs had been developed and were shared. The researcher was able to show the video that he had taken and the participants’ responses to the visit were captured on video”.* (Appendix A, pA9)

The diary entries for this visit in 2005 illustrate the extent to which the researcher planned for the expansion of participation in the partnership and sought to adopt a democratic approach in decision making.

#### *d) A Democratic Approach to Decision Making*

Fortnightly meetings were organised for participants to engage in discussion and make decisions about how to further the partnership. These meetings provided a forum for views to be expressed and many of the activities that have been run to raise funds have been suggestions made by staff, parents or students at these meetings or in other forums. An illustration of the democratic nature of the decision making process is evident in the decision about where

the money raised from fundraising go. This decision has been made by a wide range of people as follows:

- The researcher's wife suggested that the money be used to support Nqabakazulu students through University. Participants at Salisbury High School and at Nqabakazulu School supported this suggestion. The decision as to which students receive the bursaries is made by a group of teachers at Nqabakazulu School.
- The Headteacher at Nqabakazulu School and his colleagues decided to spend some money on a new computer and chairs for the students.
- The participants in the Black Dust book project decided to raise money to support students through university.
- Salisbury High School and Nqabakazulu School participants decided to use some of the money to bring extra students over from South Africa to the UK.
- The Headteacher and his colleagues decided to use some of the money to repair computers, some towards supporting the feeding scheme and some to help to build a School Hall.

The locus of decision-making has therefore been distributed amongst many participants. There has been no single dominant voice. As shown above, suggestions which have been implemented have come from participants in both schools. This illustrates the democratic nature of the process. The setting up of a committee to make these decisions has been resisted because of the danger that it would become an institutionalised body that would remove power from the participants in the partnership.

*e) Summary of Evidence for Democracy and Participation in the Partnership as it Developed.*

The researcher can evidence the level of democracy and participation in the partnership in a number of ways:

- By recounting the stories of the participants in the partnership in this research project. By giving a voice to their narrative and putting it in the public domain the narrative itself and the claims that are made from it are subject to public scrutiny.
- The researcher's own accounts and the accounts of the participants show how others have been involved in a democratic manner in the development of the international partnership. The success of this can be gauged from their participation and the mass participation in activities, such as sponsored events and the book launch, related to the partnership.
- There is evidence, as shown briefly here and more fully in the section 5.3.3, that the activities of the partnership are empowering individuals to live out their values more fully and to improve their lives. It is in this sense that democracy, in the way that Paulo Friere (1970) uses the word, is being encouraged. Lunga, the South African student interviewed that has received a bursary, was clear that it has empowered him to improve his own situation and that of his family (Chapter 4, section 4.3.3, figure 4f). Siyabonga talked in his interview about how receiving a bursary would enable him, and others from the

School, to realise their hopes and dreams. (Chapter 4, section 4.5.1.2, figure 4n, memo 3)

- By involving the participants as co-researchers in the research project as outlined below.

#### 5.3.2.3 Co-Research Participation in the Project

As stated in the research methodology (See chapter 3) a participant action research approach was the chosen methodology for this project, with colleagues and other participants acting as co-researchers in the partnership and researching the influence that it is having on the education of others.

There are several examples of this as follows.

The voices of Cath, Stacey and Siyabonga are very clearly represented in the evidence presented and analysed in section 4.5.1. They are co-participants in the research. It was Cath who took the video footage on the 2008 visit to South Africa. The research project was discussed with Cath before she went to South Africa and the sort of footage that she might take in order to provide data was agreed. It was she who interviewed Stacey and asked the questions that enabled the researcher to elicit findings for the research project (See section 4.5.1).

A video interview with Lunga was conducted by Bob Ainsworth during his visit to South Africa with one other member of staff, eleven students and a parent in May 2009. The researcher provided Bob with the video camera prior to the trip and the footage that he might take was discussed.

Furthermore, during the South Africans' visit to Salisbury in May 2009 the researcher was given two reports of reflections from Nqabakazulu students who had visited the UK and written responses to questions from three students and one member of staff from Salisbury High School (Appendix F). The questions had been written and interviews conducted by one of the Nqabakazulu school students who had visited the UK in 2008. She knew about the research project and unknown to the researcher she had conducted this research on behalf of the project. These accounts can be drawn upon to validate the findings of the research project. This participative approach has enriched the evidence base.

Similarly, a report was received from David Ngcobo, the Chairman of Nqabakazulu School External Relations Committee, who had visited Salisbury High School in 2008 which contributed to the project (Appendix M). Again, this was not explicitly asked for by the researcher. The participants seemed to want to engage in the project as co-researchers, not merely as passive participants.

Extending participation in the research project in this way helps to sustain the project and increases capacity. It is an indication of the democratic values that underpin the research project and the partnership. By asking questions of the participants about how the partnership should develop the researcher is consulting and demonstrating those democratic values. It is also a way of avoiding the post-colonial pitfalls of imposing western culture. Consulting on



how the partnership should move forward provides ownership for the participants and makes them think of appropriate activities, contributing to their learning.

Thus extending participation and democracy are values that underpin the partnership. Alongside Ubuntu, social justice and equal opportunities these values are highly significant in driving the partnership forward.

#### 5.3.2.4 The Extent of Participation by Pupils in the Partnership

Over the ten year period 50 pupils have participated in exchange visits between the two schools. The evidence shows that the activities of the partnership have had a significant impact on them. In Appendix N (figure Ne) the South African students talk about their experiences in the UK and in Appendix E UK pupils returning from a visit to South Africa talk about what they gained from the visit. Two quotes from Appendix F, one from a South African pupil participant, Winile (Source A), and one from a UK participant, Toby (Source F), illustrate the potential impact of an exchange visit:

*“Going to England was an opportunity that I was granted by the exchange programme we have with Salisbury, one I treasure most. It has had an enormous impact in my life for I have a different perspective of (sic.)things, having been exposed to a different country, a different community, school and lifestyle” (Appendix F, Source A, pF1).*

*“I won’t take many things for granted. I’ll respect more and appreciate free education” (Appendix F, Source F, pF9).*

Clearly an exchange visit can have a profound impact on pupil participants. The difficulty is that the costs prohibit mass participation in such visits. The majority of the pupils at the two schools are unable to afford to make a visit and instead rely on second-hand accounts through Assemblies and delivery in lessons. Mass participation in fundraising events such as sponsored walks and sponsored swims raising many thousands of pounds indicated that pupils were engaging with the activities of the partnership.

The impact of the Assemblies and curriculum delivery can be gauged through the reaction of three students who came to the researcher after an Assembly with another fundraising idea. They are boys who have been challenging teachers at the School for much of the year. They were keen to run a football tournament to help to raise money because:

*“We want to help those students in Africa, to send more of them to College. We want to raise the awareness of students in other schools in our area and for fun” (Appendix A, pA12)*

This extract from the researcher’s reflective diary illustrates the impact that Assemblies can have in widening pupil participation in the activities of the partnership.

**Figure 5g – Reflective Diary**

The desire to encourage participation in acts of social responsibility is what motivates me to do five Assemblies during a week at the School on return to the UK. The theme for the week is Choices and I show slides of the School and the communities of South Africa. My commentary is about the circumstances of the learners at the School and the conditions in the black township community. I highlight the contrast between the opulent wealth of the suburban white community and the black township. Some staff told me afterwards that they found the Assembly very interesting and that the students were engrossed by it. At the Assemblies I announce the sponsored walk and there is an excellent response with 130 students led by 78 staff embarking on the walk. This will raise around £2000 for the South African School helping to transform the lives of their learners. Our Headteacher also announced a non-uniform day to coincide with the walk, which will raise another £500. For me, these actions are evidence of the increasing participation of students and adults in the partnership process and recognition by them that they have a responsibility toward fellow human beings.

(Appendix A, pA27)

#### 5.3.2.5 Summary of Findings in Response to Research Question 2

Research Question 2 - To what extent has the researcher encouraged participation and democracy through his actions in establishing, developing and sustaining the partnership?

Synthesis of the evidence shows that participation and democracy have been extended throughout the lifetime of the research project. Participation from both communities has been encouraged and the response has been positive. Decision making has been shared and consultation on how to take the partnership forward has been extensive. There has been co-research participation in the project.

### **5.3.3 Touching the Hearts of Participants and Encouraging them to Live out Their Values More Fully.**

#### Research Question 3

What has been learned from the activities of the partnership by the participants and to what extent have they been able to live out their values as citizens of the world more fully?

#### 5.3.3.1 Introduction

It is here that the centre of this thesis lies. This section provides evidence of how participants have lived out their values more fully and have therefore become, in the researcher's words, 'living citizens'. This term, which, as explained in section 3.2.9, has been adapted from the notion of living educational theory is exemplified and evidenced in this section. It explores the extent to which the activities of the partnership have tapped in to the values held by participants as outlined previously, have touched their hearts (Sayers, 2002) and motivated them to act as citizens of the world.

Evidence is taken from the researcher's reflective diary in written and video form, from the analysis of video interviews and from other pieces of written data to outline the activities of the partnership and the critical episodes of learning that have taken place. The intention is that this narrative enables the reader to see how the educational partnership has been established, has developed and continues to be sustained and how such a partnership can generate activities which touch the hearts of participants and urge them to act as socially responsible living citizens.

The section begins with an analysis of how the researcher's own learning has developed as a result of the activities of the partnership, so as to indicate the potential for learning that lies with the project.

#### 5.3.3.2 Changing The Researcher's Perceptions

It is important that the partnership is encouraging a critical approach in order to avoid the pitfalls of international educational partnerships as identified by Martin (2007) and Disney (2004). The avoidance of the reinforcement of stereotypes and negative prejudice requires a critical approach to educational partnerships. The evidence presented here in this reflective piece suggests that the researcher has adopted a critical approach.

A change in the researcher's image and perception of Africa came about when he first visited Africa in 1988. The visit to the Cameroon meant that Africa was no longer a remote continent with problems that there was no need to get involved in. The problems and challenges became real, so that when visiting the continent for the second time, this time South Africa, the researcher was looking for opportunities to develop a partnership with a School and get involved in meeting the challenges.

On reflection the initial desire to provide resources and equipment for Nqabakazulu School, at the behest of the Headteacher of Nqabakazulu School, to help to turn it in to a clone of a UK school can be construed as misguided. This desire came from what the researcher can now see was a

belief in the pedagogical superiority of UK Schools. The researcher was seeking to impose a model of a western school in the South African context, a sort of pedagogical imperialism. This was falling in to the trap of reinforcing traditional stereotypical views of the dependency of the people of the south and of the superiority of western culture as identified by Martin (2007) and can be seen as a continuation of colonialism (Disney, 2004).

Insufficient consultation had taken place and the cultural context had not been accounted for. This realisation led to a change in approach to establishing dialogue with a range of people in both schools and communities. The emphasis shifted to discussion about the values that underpin the partnership, so that over time a shared language was developed (See section 5.3.1.3).

Figure 5h	<b>Development of Shared Language</b>
<p>Rose Miyakho – <i>“What you are doing guys, its more than Ubuntu and I don’t know how much to thank you.”</i> (Chapter 4, figure 4f)</p>	
<p>My Speech – <i>“Our partnership is based on the principle of umuntu, umuntu, ugabantu, which in English means, a person is a person through other persons.”</i> (Chapter 4, figure 4i)</p>	
<p>David Ngcobo, Chairperson of the External Relations Committee – <i>“Thanks Mark, continue the good work to bring light to Nqabakazulu School. Ubuntu ungumuntu ngabantu. A person is a person because of their people. Mark and family you must always keep in mind that you have made yourselves so many families in South Africa.”</i> (Appendix M, p6)</p>	

As these dialogues progressed the emphasis shifted towards exchange visits and the provision of bursaries for students of Nqabakazulu School to attend

University. This represented an important change in that there was no longer the assumption that in the UK there was a superior system that could be transferred and imposed on Nqabakazulu School. The emphasis became how to help Nqabakazulu School and Kwamashu community to help themselves. The provision of funding would help to transform the lives of some of the learners and their communities whilst retaining their cultural identity and integrity. This is in accordance with McCall Smith's (2000) view that foreign organisations have been too eager in telling Africans what to do and how to do things. Whilst the advice may be good and the solutions may work elsewhere, Africans need their own solutions to the problems that they face.

Conversation about the partnership with Nick Maurice, Director of United Kingdom One World Linking Association, led to the researcher gaining a new understanding of the word "development". He no longer regards it as a continuum with market based western economies as more developed than African economies, but as a term that carries with it more than economic development. "Development" is seen in the sense of the opening of an envelope, releasing and then reaching potential. Thus the seeds of development are in the culture and values of the community. With help and friendship they are more able to grow and develop as a community and fulfil their potential.

In response to the charge of responding in a stereotypical way to the problems of South Africa Eden Charles reminds us of another stereotype about black people;



*“There is a stereotype about black people being happy even as they are treated abominably and facing the most dehumanising of experiences. This stereotype has been used to justify the negative treatment” (Charles Eden 2006; P.1)*

It has also been used to excuse inaction. After visiting Africa and experiencing the social conditions in the black townships, inaction is simply not an option.

One of the critical learning episodes for the researcher has been recognising the impact that individual human beings can have on one’s feelings.

Individuals’ words and actions can touch the hearts of others. There have been several instances of this: the gaze of a student in a photograph (See section 1.4); the words of Siyabonga captured on video (Appendix O, play time 10.30); Confidence’s letter (Appendix G). Her letter struck a chord with the researcher. Perhaps it is the response to these individuals that shows our humanity. The researcher’s humanity has been commented upon by a colleague at Salisbury High School in his leaving speech and by Jack Whitehead from Bath University, a former tutor.

This account of some critical learning episodes for the researcher that have been brought about as a result of the activities of the educational partnership shows the potential to challenge stereotypical images and prejudices and serves as an illustration of the learning potential of the partnership. It is this

sort of learning that has motivated the researcher to develop and sustain the partnership.

It is not only the researcher whose learning has been influenced by the activities of the partnership. Many participants' hearts have been touched by individuals and have responded accordingly, as can be seen in the evidence outlined in the next section.

#### 5.3.3.3 Examples of Participants Living out their Values more Fully

Participants returning from a visit during which they have worked in the South African school for a week indicate the life-changing nature of the experience. For example, Heather (2005) says *"I was just blown away by the people and the place and I really want to do something different in my life. This was a most amazing experience and I've got to make it work."* (Appendix E, pE1)

As a result, many participants engage in activities for the partnership to provide social justice and more equal opportunities arising from their concern for individual and societal well-being. The following examples illustrate this response:

#### **Example 1 – Black Dust**

Firstly, there is the publication of a book by an internationally renowned author, Graham Joyce, in aid of the School. Bob Wardzinski, a colleague of the researcher's at Salisbury High School, mentioned the School link with Nqabakazulu School to Graham Joyce, fantasy fiction prize winning author, at

a convention. Graham agreed to publish some of his short stories as a book, called Black Dust, to raise funds to support students from Nqabakazulu School through their first year of University. This was a remarkable turn of events. Bob worked hard in involving a number of other contacts: designers; proof-readers, printers to make the publication happen. He engaged his students at School in marketing the book. Many advance orders were taken and Black Dust was published in 2005. Sufficient funds have been raised to offer scholarships to Nqabakazulu students for five years and sales of the book continue to this day. This illustrates the humanity of these people. Their actions embody similar values to the researcher's own. Their human spirit was touched to react in this way to a problem. The giving of their time and creativity to help others in this way is a symbol of their humanity. Graham shows that he was motivated by social justice to engage in these activities to raise funds for the School as this quote from his speech at the book launch indicates.

*“When I was eighteen I wanted to change the world and everyone told me that you can't change this world. Well, maybe they are right, but what is true is that you can change the world for one person and you can change the world for ten people and projects like this are here to remind us about what you can do.”*

(Dvd – Black Dust, Roberts, 2005: 10.33 – 10.54)

Graham, the illustrator, the printers and the students who did the marketing of the book have been touched by the activities of the partnership and motivated to act to increase social justice.

### **Example 2 – Aurore and Lunga**

A second example of a participant actively seeking to increase social justice and involving others in doing so is Aurore. She is one of the teachers that visited Ngabakazulu School in South Africa in February 2005. On her return, she says;

*“I’ve started doing things with my tutor group, 9X1, we have set up things that we can do to raise money so that we can send Lunga to University next year for Art. I am really excited about it. One of my friends is going to run the Newcastle marathon and all the funds from that are going to support Lunga at University”. (Appendix D, Section D.2, pD5)*

She had already, within ten days of returning from our visit, acted to involve more people in the link by organising fundraising events to raise money to support a student, Lunga, that she met at the School. He is a talented artist and he had demonstrated this whilst working with staff and students on art projects at the School.

There is evidence in her words and more importantly in her subsequent actions that she is committed to the values of social justice and equality.

In responding to a question about what made her want to raise money for Lunga she says:

*“When we were there (In South Africa) we talked about his life and family. He lives in complete poverty with his mother and numerous siblings as his father died when he was younger and his mother’s unemployed. He has only one dream, which is to go and study architecture at University. But when he talked about it he knew it was only a dream and that it would never happen. And when I thought of it, I realised how easy it would be for me to send him to University. I would need to raise £2000 in ten months. I started the charity events after Easter. (Appendix D, Section D.2, pD6)*

Aurore was responding in a very human way, displaying her own humanity. The visit that enabled her to come in to contact with this student led to her responding in accordance with her own values of humanity and social justice.

Nor was the impact short lived. Two years later Aurore organised a French lunch and a talent show to raise further funds to support Lunga. The time and effort involved in organising these events shows her commitment to expressing her embodied values through her actions. Twenty people participated in the talent show and there was an audience of over 200 people. This became a major school event and the event in itself was a good example

of how to develop ubuntu. Staff and students combined to provide entertainment for the audience building a sense of togetherness and shared humanity on the evening. She wrote in the Salisbury High School Newsletter:

*“The evening was a huge success and thanks to the effort of some very talented people and many supportive others, we managed to raise £600. This has allowed South African student Lunga to register at university to finalise his degree. He was overwhelmed by this and asked me to thank everyone involved. We have helped Lunga to follow his dream which started two years ago when we first decided to raise money to send him to university”* (A Taltavull, 2008, Appendix D, Section D.2, pD8).

Lunga’s response to these efforts was captured on video and is analysed fully in figure 4f, Section 4.3.3. Lunga says:

*“Since you guys came to South Africa and I asked you for financial support due to the financial constraints that I had from my family there has been a great change, because I am at the University of South Africa doing B.Com specialisation in marketing and I’m doing quite well. So from what you have contributed I am at a higher level now”*

and

*“There is a lack of finance available at home “and if I get the opportunity to complete my degree and to work, it will bring (provide) bread at home. My young sisters and brother who are still at School would be able to get educated, so that initiative (the bursary support) is part of building the*

*community. Without me being in the labour force, there wouldn't be bread at home."*

It is clear that Aurore's fundraising efforts have enabled him to further his education and to be optimistic about the future regarding employment and improving the position of his family so that his younger brothers and sister will be able to concentrate on their own education and not have to worry about working to provide food for the family.

### **Example 3 - Cath McKenna**

Cath was the Head of Humanities at Salisbury High School from 2001 to 2008. She got involved in the partnership at an early stage. In 2005 she was in the party that visited South Africa as were her two daughters. This visit galvanised her to become centrally involved in the partnership. She developed curriculum work in Citizenship and in Humanities for Salisbury High School students based on the link with Nqabakazulu School.

#### *a) The Citizenship project*

Cath wrote the partnership in to the scheme of work for Citizenship so that all of the Key Stage 3 students at Salisbury High School learn from it. The scheme involves using video footage from the visits to Nqabakazulu School and the community of Kwamashu, to raise students' awareness of the challenges that they face. It also involves the students doing research in to HIV/AIDs and in to Zulu culture.

### *b) Humanities Project*

Cath also developed a Humanities project for the visit to South Africa in 2008. This involved a study of site and settlement with Salisbury High School students studying the history of Salisbury and how it had developed as a settlement and sharing this information through leaflets and photographs with the Nqabakazulu students, who in turn produced information on the development of Durban as a settlement. This information then became a bank of resources for students to use in their lessons to do a comparison of the development of these two sites and settlements.

Thus Cath has played a major role in embedding the partnership in the curriculum as it has become a focus for study as part of the Citizenship course and as part of the Humanities course at KS3. These sorts of projects bear out Reason's (2005) assertion that the global perspective is increasingly being implemented in the curriculum, indicating a shift in approach that seeks to raise awareness of the connections between people throughout the world and contributing to an understanding of global interdependence.

### *c) Other Contributions*

Cath also raised funds for Nqabakazulu School to support their feeding scheme and to support other projects. In 2008 Cath led the visit to South Africa with another teacher from our School. Prior to the visit the researcher met with her to discuss her participation as a researcher to support the research project. She took video footage and contributed to the findings for this project. Her belief in the learning potential for students is shown in her



use of the phrase, *"they have grown as people as a result of it"* (Section 4.5.1.2, figure 4k, memo 5) to describe the impact of the visits on our students. This resonates with the educational notion of "touching" hearts as used by Sayers (2002) in her description of the purpose of citizenship education. Cath is very clear about what she has learned from the partnership and expresses this learning in terms of changes in perception and changes in behaviour.

The evidence shows that Cath has been a major contributor to the partnership and an active participant in the action research project. She has taken a series of actions, including involvement in fundraising, the development of curriculum projects and the making of friendships, that have demonstrated her commitment to the aims of the partnership and she has influenced others to become actively involved in the partnership. In her video interview the development of personal relationships between individuals in the two schools is a feature of her response. Friendship is an important element in the sustaining of the partnership. Cath talks about how the students from Salisbury High School visiting Nqabakazulu School and visits from Nqabakazulu School students and staff to the UK have provided personal contact with people of a different culture allowing personal relationships and friendships to develop (Section 4.5.1.2, figure 4k, memo 2). Through these visits the opportunity has arisen to explore, reflect upon and experience their own qualities and to decide how to act in response to the issues raised. The students' hearts have been "touched" and this has made the meaning of good citizenship real to the students and staff.

#### **Example 4 - Beautizulu Jewellery**

This next example to illustrate the influence that the activities have had on the learning of others is an example of a project that has been initiated by Nqabakazulu School. During the Salisbury High School visit to South Africa in 2007 the researcher was approached by one of the teachers, Neliswa, and asked whether Zulu crafts made by the students at the School could be taken to the UK and sold with profits being shared between the two communities. On return to the UK the researcher spoke with the Head of Business Studies at Salisbury High School, Bob Ainsworth, and asked whether he thought this was a viable business proposition. Due to his positive response he was put in touch with Neliswa and an agreement was drawn up for a joint business venture. A few months later a large package containing many hand-made items of jewellery arrived through the post.

Figure 5i

## Photograph of Business Students

(Permission gained from parents for use of photograph in post-project publications)



Bob got the Business students at Salisbury High School to research the marketing of jewellery and then to price each item up and make it ready for sale. Sales were made in School lunch times and at School events. Discussions continued between Bob and Neliswa about the quality and content of the jewellery. There was some high quality learning going on as they and their students discussed the cultural differences between the South African market and the UK market for jewellery. What might sell well in a South African market does not necessarily sell well in the UK for various reasons, such as fashion or tastes, or climate. For example, some Zulu jewellery is made from safety pins and this could not be sold in the UK for health and safety reasons. Lessons are being learned as the business progresses and the South African suppliers are gradually adapting their products to suit the UK market.

The curriculum focus for the exchange visits of 2009 was the further development of this business. The Salisbury High School students, when they visited Nqabakazulu School, learned about Zulu culture and part of this was how to make the jewellery, thus they learned a traditional Zulu craft. This enhanced their understanding of Zulu culture and developed their respect for the Zulu cultural heritage. It also gave them an understanding of the skills and time involved in producing the jewellery. Bob and Neliswa focussed on the notion of fair trade and how this project promotes the tenets of fair trade with a fair share of the profits going to the suppliers of the products. During the visit to the UK the South African students learned about marketing skills and studied the UK market, increasing their understanding of the UK consumer's requirements. This made them more aware of the needs of the UK consumer and better prepared for providing products which meet their needs. In addition, they learned, alongside UK students, how to build a website for the business to promote their products. This is a technological skill that they have taken back with them to South Africa.

During their week in at Salisbury High School they also showed our students how to make the jewellery. Success in marketing the product was shown when a very successful sale during the week in a half hour lunch time raised £400 towards the feeding scheme at Nqabakazulu School, a scheme that provides food for their most needy students. The response of our staff and students was very positive as they wanted to be part of the project and show their support for it. Video footage was taken and this shows Business students

preparing for the sale, a packed School Hall, students busy selling the jewellery, and students, staff and parents buying the jewellery. The students show that they have learned about the principles of fair trade and why they are buying the jewellery. Here are some quotes from students in the video:

Student A *“All the money that is made from the sale on Friday is going back to South Africa, back to the people who made what we are selling”*

Student B - *“(It is) for the poor, the needy, for clean water and healthy food”*.

This project is one that was initiated by a South African teacher and has been sustained by communication between Bob and Neliswa. The researcher’s role has been to facilitate that communication and to support Bob in his endeavours to sell the jewellery at School events.

Bob has visited South Africa twice and has been touched by the experience and his reaction has been to run this project that in turn has touched many other participants, staff, students, governors and parents. The project continues and ways are being looked at to provide new outlets for sales of the jewellery.

The Beautizulu jewellery project has led to the establishment of a Fair Trade group at Salisbury High School comprised of students, teachers, support staff, governors and members of the Salisbury community. This group is promoting fair trade within the school and the community and is working to gain fair trade status for the School, a national award to mark the work of the school as a fair trade organisation. Part of this process is the teaching of fair trade in different

curriculum areas. Bob Wardzinski, who has been heavily involved in the international partnership has led this work and it has developed out of the jewellery project and the focus of the exchange visit in 2009. It is a good example of how the activities of the partnership can lead to associated activities that broaden participants' learning.

### **Example 5 - Gillian – School Governor**

#### *The Hospice Minibus Appeal*

During the 2007 Salisbury High School visit to Kwamashu township a visit to a Children's Home and AIDS Hospice was organised. Many of the children attend Nqabakazulu School. Whilst there, participants were told about their efforts to raise funds to buy a vehicle to take patients to hospital and the orphans to School. There is a danger of girls being raped on the way to and from School. This appeal touched the hearts of the participants and discussions took place as to how help might be provided. A Salisbury High School Governor who was on the trip, Gillian, is involved in the local church in the community in Salisbury. She agreed that she would seek to get her church community involved. On our return she spread the message about the appeal to raise funds for the minibus. Individual donations were forthcoming and the church decided to make it one of their chosen charities to support in the coming year. At Salisbury High School some additional funds were raised through sponsored events. Gillian approached the local Rotary Club and they agreed to support the fundraising efforts. The appeal was publicised on the local radio and in the local press. Within a few months sufficient funds had been raised to pay for a vehicle. The following is an extract from a letter from

the Treasurer of the Bemerton Parochial Church Council to Salisbury High School.

*“I attach a cheque of £1,125.00 from the Parish of Bemerton towards the Nqabakazulu School minibus appeal. I trust this will help the minibus scheme become a reality soon. If you obtain any pictures of the minibus please pass these on as we are keen to become more closely involved with the school and local community in Kwamashu township.”*

Further partnership activity between the two communities of Bemerton, Salisbury and Kwamashu township was initiated when members of Nqabakazulu school visited Salisbury accompanied by the matron of the Children’s Home/Hospice. She was introduced to the local community and friendships were forged. She visited the hospice in Salisbury and a link between the two hospices has now been created. Other links were also forged as this comment from Gillian shows:

*The Trussell Trust became involved when Thobile visited. She was interested in their Food Bank and Restore Shop – she was surprised that in England there are white people who are poor and in need which led to some deep conversations about English society and life. Trussell Trust made clothing given to the charity shop available to her without payment, so that she was able to take something for each of the children back to South Africa with her. Later we attempted to send a box of things like school shirts, socks, and PE kit (provided free by the Trussell Trust) out to them – and individual church*

*members bought pencil cases, pens, erasers, colouring pencils etc to send out to the children for Christmas. The firm one of our church members works for exports by air all over the world and they took an interest and offered to transport the large boxes for us without payment. However customs officials at Johannesburg would not allow the boxes to be delivered without payment of several hundred pounds in excise duty – more than the cost of the contents – which proved an insuperable barrier to helping them in this way.*

(Email received December 2010 – See Appendix P, pP4)

Thus the work that Gillian started has grown and led to the participation of more people in the partnership. The church community have adopted the Children's Home/Hospice as one of their charities and most recently they have offered to pay for legal advice for them on how to achieve charitable status in South Africa so that they can access various government grants to provide for themselves. The aim is to provide a sustainable source of funding for the Hospice, instead of one-off funding from the UK. Gillian's comment on why she has got involved is included in her email:

*The link is a vehicle for myself and the rest of the ministry team here to make those we preach to aware of things like global poverty, injustice and the scourge of HIV/AIDS in a grounded, personal way that they can relate to.*

(Appendix P, pP4)

This comment sits well with the notion of living citizenship as the participants live out their values in an active way rather than as passive onlookers.



### **Example 6 - Christine**

Evidence of long-term impact of the partnership on the life of a participant is in relation to Christine. The researcher conducted an interview with her five years after her visit to South Africa as a student member of the group in 2005. In the interview she is very clear about the impact of the visit on her subsequent choice of course at University and of career in charity work. In the video interview she says the trip to South Africa during her gap year confirmed her desire to study international development at University and,

*“While I was at University I was very committed to my course because I knew that I wanted to do something to work with people like those that we had visited at the School, so it had a big impact on me.”*

These examples show participants in the educational partnership acting to live out their values of social justice and equal opportunity more fully. The researcher and other participants in the partnership have recognised the injustice of the situation in the black township and have advocated change. Participants have mobilised others to recognise the lack of social justice and equality of opportunity and to take action to change the situation. In this sense these values have become central to the work of the international partnership.

There is agreement with the author of the article (Anon 2002, p.15) in the Development Education Association publication who says:

*“Teachers need to recognise their own values and attitudes as part of the process of encouraging pupils to explore theirs”*

Through the partnership activity, teachers, parents and adult members of the community are recognising their own values and attitudes. Their reflections are leading to actions to live out their values more fully. This is encouraging students to do the same.

In section 2.4.2 the question was posed, how can evidence be provided that it is the activities of the partnership that have stimulated another person’s soul and entered his/her very being? (Chomsky, 1971) The researcher claims that the evidence provided by the actions of these participants illustrates that a desire to live out their values more fully entered their very being. They were creative in their responses as human beings.

The hearts of the participants were sufficiently touched by the activities of the partnership that they had an impact on their own lives and on their subsequent actions. The international partnership led to sustained long-term impact on learning on several fronts. The long-term impact has been to produce a response that improves the lives of citizens in both communities.

#### 5.3.3.4 Learning That Tackles Stereotypes and Negative Prejudice

There is evidence that other participants views of the respective communities have changed as a result of the activities of the partnership. The South African students and staff indicate that their pre-conceptions of the welcome

that they would get from the UK students were not borne out when they say, after spending a week visiting Salisbury High School and a local primary school:

*“The children are very friendly and I did not expect that because of our colour.”* (Appendix N, figure Ne, pN11)

In the interview Mr Rhmbele supports the assertion about the friendship shown by the Salisbury High School students with the comment:

*“Most students were friendly towards us. Some went the extra mile and were like brothers and sisters to us.”* (Appendix N, figure Nf, pN14-N15)

Two other members of staff, David and Thuli, from South Africa report the following:

*“The visit destroyed stereotypes of English people as cold and unfriendly, not accepting of strangers and intransigent. We have found them the direct opposite of this”* (Appendix L, pL1)

David in his report (Appendix M) makes the following remarks:

*“The stereotype prejudices I had about English people in the UK is gone for good, the hatred is buried. The warmth, hospitality, courtesy, etiquette was insurmountable. It is something that will live for a very long time with me. You*

*showed us dignity that our fellow white South Africans find it very difficult to practice.” (p7)*

In the interview with the South African students at Nqabakazulu School about their expectations for their visit to Salisbury (Appendix B, figure Bi, pB23), they had said that they were fearful that they would experience racism at Salisbury High School, which is a predominantly white school. As it turned out they were very complimentary about the welcome that they received from the students. According to the Nqabakazulu students, The Salisbury High School students showed great friendship to the visiting students. They appreciated their circumstances and went out of their way to make them feel welcome (Appendix N, figure Ne, pN11). This willing participation in the partnership and demonstration of the value of Ubuntu by the students makes is further evidence of the impact of the partnership. Many of them took the opportunity to live out their values more fully by engaging with the South African students and developing friendships with them.

Similarly UK visitors to South Africa report a change in their perceptions as these quotes (Appendix F) illustrate:

*“I didn’t expect the warm welcome.” (Source E)*

*“I’ve met new people, new friends and they respected me like I never expected.” (Source E)*

*“I didn’t expect people to be as welcoming. I thought they’d be cautious of us.” (Source F)*

*“I now know how people around here live and how they spend their money and don’t waste it. Also how hard people here work in school as compared to Salisbury High School.” (Source G)*

This evidence is taken from people who have participated in a visit to the other community, suggesting that this activity is a powerful tool in tackling the stereotypes and negative prejudice. There is also evidence that suggests the visitors’ activities have had an impact on the hosts.

**Figure 5j – Analysis of Section 4.5.1.2, Figure 4k, Memo 3**

*Cath explains how the South African students were very confident in performing when they visited our School. This would have inspired some of our students to be more confident. The first visitors from Nqabakazulu School to our School were chosen for their musical, dance and drama ability and their talents in presenting artistic interpretations of Zulu culture. They were outstanding at this and it helped to tackle the post-colonial stereotypical views of Africans as receivers of aid and not having anything to give in return. It emphasised the reciprocal nature of the partnership in terms of the learning that was taking place.*

These quotes from Salisbury High School students after they have attended a lesson in Citizenship led by a South African visitor indicate changes in perception about Africa:

*“The South Africans are not as poor as I thought they would be.”*

*“It sounds much better than I had thought it was in Africa.”*

*“I thought their village would be quite small but there are half a million people.”*

*“It is poor in places but they make it lively with their dancing.”*

*“Parts of the town are modern.”*

*“They all go to school.”*

*“The small amount of money they earn goes a long way over there.”*

*“I always thought there was much more poverty but it actually sounds quite modern.”*

(Appendix N, figure Nd, Pp N8-9)

These comments show an acceptance that things are not as bad as is often portrayed.

There is however a comment that runs counter to the challenging of stereotypes and indicates that the “poor but happy” stereotype may persist in the student’s mind. He comments: *“It is poor in places but they make it lively with their dancing”*. (Appendix N, figure Nd, pN9)

There is a synthesis of evidence to suggest that reciprocal visits were the most successful activity in challenging stereotypes and encouraging a critical approach in the partnership. There is less evidence to suggest that the other activities of the partnership, the use of video footage and photographs in Assemblies and in curriculum activities had an impact in tackling stereotypes.

### 5.3.3.5 Summary of Findings in Response to Research Question 3

Research Question 3 - What has been learned from the activities of the partnership by the participants and to what extent have they become better citizens of the world?

The examples of participants' responses are significant in that they provide clear evidence of the educational potential of an international partnership. It has been shown that a wide range of activities can be developed that engage participants and enable them to become more informed citizens who live out their values more fully through their actions.

The following themes emerge from the evidence presented in this section:

- Critical learning episodes for the researcher have been brought about as a result of the activities of the international educational partnership and these have challenged stereotypical images and prejudices and serve as an illustration of the learning potential of the partnership.
- Through the partnership activities, teachers, students, parents and adult members of the community are recognising their own values and attitudes. Their reflections are leading to actions to live out their values more fully.
- Due to the design of activities there is a significant long-term impact from the partnership
- Reciprocal visits have been a powerful means of tackling stereotypes and negative prejudice.

### 5.3.4 Summary of Emergent Themes

In addressing the overarching research question concerning the reconceptualization of international educational partnerships as a form of 'Living Citizenship' the evidence has been synthesised into three emergent themes which address the first three sub-research questions as follows:

**Figure 5k – Research questions and themes**

Research question	Emergent Themes
<p>1. To what extent have the values of social justice, equal opportunities and Ubuntu been put at the heart of the international partnership between the schools?</p> <p>To what extent have shared values and a shared language for expressing these values been developed in establishing the partnership?</p>	<p>Shared values at the heart of the partnership, including Ubuntu, equal opportunities and social justice. The emergence of a shared language.</p>
<p>2. To what extent has the researcher encouraged participation and democracy through his actions in establishing, developing and sustaining the partnership?</p>	<p>Extending participation and democracy through the conduct of the research project.</p>
<p>3. What has been learned from the activities of the partnership by the participants and to what extent have they been able to live out their values as</p>	<p>Touching the hearts of participants and engaging them in the activities of the partnership so that they have the opportunity to</p>



citizens of the world more fully?	live out their values more fully.
-----------------------------------	-----------------------------------

## **5.4 Post-Qualitative Checks**

Two techniques, corroborative checks and peer review, have been used to check the validity of the findings after they have emerged.

### **5.4.1 Corroborative Checks**

#### **5.4.1.1 – Outline of Checks Carried Out**

Firstly, the accuracy of the data and of the findings has been checked with the participants. A range of corroborative checks have been carried out with the participants as follows:

1. Video footage has been shared so that the participants could comment on it and make their own interpretations of it. Footage was shared in Assemblies and in classes with pupils and staff participants. The reactions of staff and pupils to the footage and associated activities have been indicated above in section 5.3.2.4. The ATLAS software analysis of the video footage of Cath and Stacey has been shared with Cath.
2. Each of the examples used to illustrate the impact of the activities of the partnership on others have been agreed with the participants concerned and shared with them. Emails with copies of the extracts were sent to each of the participants and they were asked to comment on the factual accuracy of the accounts and the accuracy of the claims that the researcher makes. Some amendments and additions were made as a result of the responses. (See Appendix P)
3. As mentioned in the methods section in chapter 3 (Section 3.3.10.1), two interviews were conducted with participants towards the end of the

research project for two purposes. Firstly to act as a qualitative check as findings from the research were put to the interviewees and they were asked for their opinions on the interpretation given to the evidence. Secondly, to identify where participation in the partnership has influenced them and changed their actions. Both of these interviews were captured on video and are analysed further below. Christine was chosen as an interviewee because she had been a participant in the first group visit and had then left the School to go to University. Having been away from the school for five years she would be able to indicate whether there had been any lasting impact on her as a person. Gillian was chosen because she is a member of the local community who came in to the partnership as a representative of the parish and as a governor of Salisbury High School. As someone who is not part of the every day school community she would be able to give a perspective from outside the school itself.

4. A report was commissioned from Malusi David Ngcobo, the Chairperson of the Partnership and External Relations Committee at Nqabakazulu School. This provides a corroborative check from the perspective of the South African School. (See Appendix Q)
5. The researcher sent regular reports to the British Council. Between 2007 and 2009 reports were sent annually. These reports were compiled jointly by the researcher and a representative from Nqabakazulu School with input from other participants. Usually the British Council simply acknowledged receipt of the report, however in 2009 they provided feedback by email (see section 5.4.4.5 below)

#### 5.4.1.2 Interview with Christine

In the first video interview Christine five years on from her participation in the partnership, corroborates the claim that the activities of the partnership have influenced her as a participant. She talks about how the fundraising skills that she developed whilst raising money for the South African School have helped her in subsequent jobs. She also says

*“For me, I feel very lucky that we stayed in the township with Rose, a teacher from the School, because she had two teenage daughters, who took us out in the township to visit people’s homes. Some of them were just shacks and for me that was eye opening. She also took us to the AIDs Hospice and that was the one thing that I specifically remember, the young Mum that I spoke about in Assembly, with the baby in the cot next to her and she was dying of AIDs and that had an impact on me as well”*

This corroborates the claim that visiting the South African community can have a powerful effect on participants as their hearts are touched and they are motivated to act to live out their values more fully. Christine now works for the charity, Hopes and Homes for Children. As an ex-pupil, she returned to Salisbury High School to do Assemblies on what had influenced her at School and what she had subsequently gone on to do. In the Assembly she had talked publicly about the influence of the South African partnership activities on her subsequent life choices. In the video interview she says the trip to

South Africa during her gap year confirmed her desire to study international development at University and helped to shape her subsequent career choice.

*“I knew that I wanted to do something to work with people like those that we had visited at the School, so it had a big impact on me.”*

At this point in the interview Christine gives a little nod of the head and then she shakes her head a few times and looks downwards. To the researcher viewing this footage it is evident that there is a real emotional impact as she reflects on the visit. This reaction is something the researcher missed at the time when asking the questions and would have missed entirely if it had not been for the use of video to capture the interview.

Christine recounts learning from Rose how the AIDs Hospice was established and she says how this learning enabled her to visualise during her degree how such projects are often started. This corroborates the claim that significant learning has resulted from the activities of the partnership (See section 6.2)

She goes on to talk about her values and how she had learned from the visit to South Africa.

*“I was quite privileged compared to people outside the UK. It opened my eyes to how unequal life can be. But going out there also showed me that you don’t need those things to live a healthy and happy life. I realised that I wanted to*

*do as much as I can to promote opportunities for people to have the same opportunities as I've had and to live up to their potential. That's something that I am quite motivated by".*

Thus Christine corroborates the findings that values are central to the partnership activities and that the partnership has a shared vision based around core values of social justice, equal opportunities and Ubuntu (humanity) (See section 5.3.1). She indicates in her answers just how powerful an impact the activities of the partnership have had in influencing first her choice of degree and subsequently her chosen employment.

Throughout the interview she talks about how she feels that she already carried the values within her quite strongly and that what the partnership activities did was to confirm and strengthen those values and motivate her to live them out more fully. Thus she corroborates the finding that an international educational partnership can touch the hearts of participants and have a significant impact in promoting active citizenship (See section 5.3.3).

#### 5.4.1.3 Interview with Gillian

A second interview captured on video to corroborate findings is with Gillian who became involved in the partnership activities in 2006. She talks about how she had been seeking an opportunity to visit Africa for some years and that the partnership gave her the opportunity to visit South Africa. She says that what had an impact on her was

*“just how spiritually rich and alive these people are compared with many people in England, although materially it is completely the opposite way around.”*

She talks about the impact of the visit to the AIDs Hospice/ Children’s Home and how it *“touched”* her that a relatively small amount of money was needed to provide a means of transport to significantly improve the lives of the residents. She says that when the South Africans visited the UK the people from the local Bemerton, Salisbury community got to know them, *“meeting people had a real impact”*. When the matron of the South African AIDs Hospice/Children’s Home visited Salisbury and spoke with people it *“widened people’s understanding of the reality”*. Gill says that the matron’s visit had a *“wide effect, reaching out to make people aware of things”*. She says that participation in the activities has had a real impact:

*“It becomes personal, the poverty and things. I remember somebody in the party bursting in to tears when it was said that bread was going to be delivered to 200 of the children. We just had no idea that children went to school hungry. When I am preaching and speaking about these things to people, I’ve got personal experience which makes it come alive”.*

As mentioned earlier section 5.3.3.3, example 5 Gillian’s actions have had a significant impact on members of the community who have been able to live out their values more fully as a result and this corroborates the view that the partnership is having a significant impact in the community.

#### 5.4.4.4 Malusi David Ncgobo's Report

The report was written in 2009 at the researcher's request as the funding for visits from the British Council came to an end (See Appendix Q). In the report David talks about the significance of the partnership in providing a novel experience for the pupils (learners),

*“On both sides learners were glued on the educator and attentively listened as for the first time they were taught by somebody different from them in terms of pigmentation and pronunciation” (p.Q1)*

He also talks about the impact on challenging existing perspectives:

*“Just look at the racial stereotypes, prejudices, perceptions and contradictions. Partnership was able to ameliorate and alleviate such negatives” (p.Q3)*

The impact on his own learning is no less dramatically stated,

*“I was astonished, amazed and mesmerised when Alice and Claire had to vacate their rooms for Madlala and myself. I was saddened to find out that Claire has to sleep on the floor, for me that was the highlight of my visit. I would imagine a White person in South Africa giving a Black person to sleep in his/her own bed. Most Whites in South Africa, they don't treat Black as their*



*equals, fellow citizens and counterparts, they still look at Blacks as subordinates, inferior and subservient to them.” (p.Q4)*

and

*“My perception before I went to the UK was that English people were cold, conservative, snobbish, arrogant, pompous, xenophobic and ostentatious. When I arrived I was shocked to find the direct opposite of my expectations. If there was no partnership I would have remained with my wrong perceptions.” (p.Q13)*

Thus David corroborates the claims about how the partnership activities challenged existing racial stereotypes and perceptions of the other and led to significant learning for the participants (See section 5.3.3.4). He also corroborates the claim that the partnership has developed a shared language with his comment:

*“Thanks Mark, continue the good work to bring light to Nqabakazulu High School. Umuntu ungumuntu ngabantu, a person is a person because of other people. Mark and family, you must always keep in mind that you have made yourselves so many friends and families in South Africa.” (p.Q13)*

#### 5.4.1.5 British Council Response

The British Council in their email response to the report on the activities of the partnership in 2009 say:

*“The partnership between Salisbury High School and Nqabakazulu School appears to be moving from strength to strength with progress being made on a number of the chosen global dimension themes over the course of the year. The “Fair Trade” project has positively impacted on pupils’ understanding in Citizenship and Geography. In addition, the reciprocal nature and sustainability of the joint projects has been particularly impressive and this has resulted in pupils in both schools increasing their awareness of global dimension themes. It is also commendable to note that both schools have been able to involve parents and the local community in partnership activities and this should serve to strengthen the sustainability of the link”.*

(Appendix K, PpK9-10)

This response corroborates the view that the activities of the partnership are having a long-term impact and are sustainable (See section 6.2.7) .

#### **5.4.2 Peer Review of Evidence**

Another technique used to enhance the validity of the findings was use of a peer review focus group. Over a period of two years, 2008 – 2010, the researcher used postgraduate students and tutors at Bath Spa University as a peer review focus group to consider the evidence that has been presented in this research project and to check the claims made by the researcher. Three times the researcher presented evidence to this group and on each occasion a different claim was made by the researcher. Two members of the group were always present and these were Dr Steven Coombs and Dan Davies,

both members of staff at Bath Spa University and both supervisors of the PhD. Cath McKenna, a participant in the partnership, was present on two occasions. The remainder of the group consisted of postgraduate students conducting PhD research at Bath Spa University. The number in the group varied from 5 to 9. Appendix R (Dvd) captures these peer review meetings. The accounts of the three meetings below show the responses from the participants in this post-qualitative checking process with a commentary from the researcher.

#### 5.4.2.1 Meeting 1 – February 2008 (Appendix R.1, play time 00.00 – 25.50)

The researcher gave a short presentation outlining the context of the research project and the research methodology. Then video footage that he had captured of Rose Mjiyako talking about the partnership was played to the focus group. They were asked to respond to two questions about the footage.

- To what extent does this video clip evidence a sense of togetherness (Ubuntu) and shared humanity?
- To what extent does this video clip evidence influence on the education of others?

The intention was to check with them their interpretation of the video data.

The ensuing discussion was captured on video (See Appendix R, section R.1). Below is an account of the audience response and the researcher's response (in italics) together with the researcher's reflections on this footage.

The first response from a member of the group is in the form of a question:

*Audience - How would you articulate the benefits and CPD outcomes from an international partnership of this nature to a government that might prefer to spend money on other ways of raising standards? What CPD benefits has it brought for staff participants in the partnership?*

Researcher response:

*There are many ways in which participants have benefitted, for example Aurore has developed professionally as a result of her involvement and she has got many other staff and pupils involved in living out their values more fully through participation in the partnership.*

Cath, who is a member of this group then says:

*“It’s expanded our students’ horizons a huge amount because of the work that Mark’s done. He’s presented it in a whole range of formats. We have had Assemblies. We had students over here who presented stuff and that has made it real for our students.”*

This is corroborating the claim of impact on participants (See section 6.2.2).

The next audience response is about the question of validity:

*Audience - How do you contextualise the clips and analyse them bearing in mind that they only tell part of the story?*

Researcher response

*A whole range of video clips are looked at and analysed to find emergent themes and other participants will be taking video footage during visits and that footage too will be analysed to provide triangulation of data.*

This indicates the importance of addressing issues of validity when dealing with qualitative data.

In addressing the question of Ubuntu, a member of the audience asks:

*Is there a way in which the video clips can show the notion of ubuntu, togetherness, cooperation and sharing or is there a sense in which these values are overwhelmed by the power disparity existing between north and south?*

Researcher response:

*The dangers of a post colonial approach to international educational partnerships which embed power differences are real. The power disparities can be overcome and the intention is to show in this research how this can be done. The evidence that it has been done is in the language used by the participants, for example Rose saying, “You guys are angels” and phrases like “I ask you this as a member of the family”.*

*Audience Response – The use of language is very significant. There are cultural nuances in words. When the personal relationship between people is (strong) the power disparity dissipates....and when you get to know someone better there is more common understanding.*

This corroborates the finding that the development of a shared language for the partnership is significant and indicates a sense of Ubuntu (See section 5.3.1.1). This is reinforced in another audience contribution:

*Audience – I think the video clip does show a sense of Ubuntu in the level of social interaction between you, the fact that Rose is actually taking the lead*

*and is clearly empowered by the role that she has. I think it would be good to find clips that do evidence parts of the partnership that have been initiated by the South Africans themselves.*

This response led to the researcher evidencing this in section 5.3.3.3 above, recounting the initiative of the Zulu jewellery business.

In terms of evidence of influencing others the following points were made

*Audience – Influence is about how we influence the behaviour of others and it is clear that you are being very pro-active but to what extent are others being pro-active and being inspired by you to do things which you would not have thought of?*

This comment corroborates the approach that has been taken in this chapter (Section 5.3.3.3) to demonstrate influence by giving examples of how other participants have been actively involved in the partnership.

Another response on influence is:

*Audience - The most obvious thing in terms of your influence on the education of others is if you are providing scholarships to higher education then that is something that is presumably having a direct influence on the education of those concerned and you could talk to them and find out what they have gained from it. There is a danger that the primary influence could end up being the fundraising and developing a culture of dependency.*

*Researcher response – This is a real danger and it is important that the partnership is built on an equitable basis so that whenever the UK School*

*gives something, the African school gives something in return. There is evidence of this through the cultural exchange that has taken place with the UK school using Zulu dance and Zulu art in its curriculum.*

These exchanges indicate that the peer review group are acting as critical friends in reviewing the research project. There are questions as well as comments and both encourage the researcher to reflect on issues concerning the partnership, so continuing the action reflection cycle.

#### 5.4.2.2 - Meeting 2 – November 2008 (Appendix R.2, play time 25.50 – 40.00)

At this meeting the researcher presents a paper outlining some of the evidence and some of the findings emerging from the research and seeks the response of the group to these emergent findings.

One member of the group identifies a theme in the paper:

*Audience – The evidence that you have presented seems to be predicated on the notion that actions speak louder than words. Have you worked that out in advance? There seems to be in the paper an implicit hierarchy of influence.*

This shows that the reader can see in the evidence the importance of action and corroborates the view of the researcher that this is a significant element in influencing others and in influencing social formations through the partnership (See section 6.2.4).

The discussion then moves on to social justice and stereotypes.

*Audience – It is important to clarify the meaning of social justice. Is it to do with helping them out there or is it something to do with social justice in our everyday lives, how is it affecting the way I think, the way I interact with people in our own communities?*

The researcher sees this as a key question and it reinforces the emphasis on values in the partnership, the importance of shared values and a shared understanding of what those values mean as shown in the evidence in section 5.3.1.

*Audience – I read some research recently which was postulating that some school links are reinforcing stereotypes.*

The literature critiquing school partnership has been outlined in chapter two (Section 2.2). Throughout the partnership activities have been considered which challenge these stereotypes and section 5.3.3.4 provides evidence of how pre-conceptions have been changed by these activities.

#### 5.4.2.3 - Meeting 3 – October 2010 (Appendix R.3, play time 40.05 – 1.14.59)

The group were asked to comment on the notion of living citizenship and how the researcher is communicating the notion. The researcher explains how the idea of living citizenship has emerged from a living theory approach to action research. It is defined as participants in the partnership living out their values more fully through being active citizens and through being fully engaged in the activities of the partnership to make a difference to people's lives. Some examples of participants living out their values, as used in section 5.3.3.3, are given and a video clip of Graham's speech is played.



The first response is as follows:

*Audience - It chimes very well with some of the principles of community learning, community development and community action. It seems to fit in very well with the notion of the “Big Society” and it seems to be a very positive aspiration. You would find in the adult learning and community development field a lot of arguments supporting that approach.*

This corroborates the idea of living citizenship as one that has resonance in today’s society. This idea is explained further in section 6.4.

Another respondent makes the point:

*Audience - I see the notion fitting in very comfortably with the idea of citizenship in the curriculum emphasising the responsibility of citizens rather than the rights of a citizen and also within the field of global citizenship. Where one could mount a critique is from a more radical citizenship perspective which questions and challenges ways in which society is organised, almost citizenship as civil disobedience. You could say that these people have recognised injustice and their responses to it have been to get involved with individuals and small groups to try to correct the situation. From the examples that you have shown there isn’t anyone there shouting out about the injustice that exists in the first place and using that to campaign politically to, for example, improve trade laws. At the moment I don’t see how it fits with that but I do see it fitting very well with the global citizenship ideas in the curriculum.*

This perspective is backed up by another member of the group with:

*It supports the notion of the citizen as an active, empowered contributor but not necessarily as a revolutionary.*

These responses help to locate the findings and the notion of living citizenship within the field of citizenship education. Although the activities of the partnership have challenged individuals' perspectives of others, to the researcher's knowledge it has not led to participants challenging the existing power relations through direct action, although the researcher himself has participated in political campaigns to improve social justice. This is recognised as a limitation of the partnership as discussed in section 6.7.2.2.

The discussion then moves on to distinguishing between citizenship, active citizenship and living citizenship. This discussion helps the researcher to refine the notion of living citizenship and it is described as follows:

*Researcher - Active citizenship is a part of living citizenship. Living citizenship goes beyond just being active in the sense that you are aware of why you are doing it and you are doing it to live out your values more fully, so you are aware of why you are being active.*

A group member responds with:

*Audience - Are you saying that living citizenship is not just what you do, it is who you are? It is embodied citizenship. Look at this person, not just for things they have done but look at them and how they embody the values of citizenship.*

The researcher assents to this. It is exactly that meaning that the term has and it is gratifying that the peer review group have grasped it as such. This

conversation helped the researcher to clarify the meaning of 'living citizenship' as outlined further in section 6.4.

This then leads on to a conversation about the significance of values in education. The researcher argues the importance of being able to articulate one's values and how that can provide a basis for action and a degree of confidence in decision making. A member of the group makes this point:

*Audience - Articulating your values helps other people to take action as well because it provides a lead for them. They can understand why they might want to take action.*

This conversation corroborates the view reflected in the findings that values have a central role to play in 'living citizenship' (See section 6.4.2).

#### 5.4.2.4 The Value of Peer Review Meetings

The three meetings provided an opportunity for the researcher to present findings and test ideas, such as 'living citizenship', with a group of critical friends. As the extracts and the evidence in Appendix R shows the comments made were not always favourable to the research, they were often critical and led to further reflection by the researcher. In this sense they were an important part of the action reflection cycle and contributed to the clarification of ideas as well as being part of the validation process.

#### **5.4.3 The Work is Validated by People's Response to it**

The validity of this work rests for this researcher not in any search for internal consistency or simple meaning from the data but in the responses of other

persons to it. As already shown there are numerous examples of humanitarian responses to this work. These include the following:

- Graham Joyce and the other contributors to the book, *Black Dust*, produced at no cost to the partnership to raise funds for supporting students at Nqabakazulu School.
- Graham's speech at the book launch about why he decided to participate in the partnership.
- Letters from students at Nqabakazulu School
- The interviews with students and staff from Nqabakazulu School
- Fax communications with Mr Shezi, Head at Nqabakazulu School.
- Emails from Thiris Arumugam, one time teacher at Nqabakazulu School
- Emails from Rose Mjiyako, Deputy Principal at Nqabakazulu School
- Comments and actions from Aureore, Bob Wardzinski, Bob Ainsworth, Gillian, Cath McKenna and Christine.
- Comments from other fellow participants in the link.
- Conversations with colleagues at the National Teacher Research Conference.
- British Council funding of the partnership.

### **5.5 Summary of Findings**

What has emerged from the data analysis is evidence that in the international educational partnership between Salisbury High School and Nqabakazulu School there has been:

- The development of a shared language by the participants to describe and explain the values behind the partnership (Section 5.3.1).
- Agreement on the values of Ubuntu, equal opportunities and social justice at the heart of the partnership (Section 5.3.1).
- An emphasis on extending participation and democracy in the conduct of the partnership (Section 5.3.2).
- The design of activities by the participants that have presented opportunities for participants to live out their values more fully (Section 5.3.3).
- The development of a range of activities that have touched the hearts of participants, that have had a long-term impact in the communities and have gone some way to tackling stereotypes and negative prejudices (section 5.3.3).

## **5.6 The Next Chapter**

In the next chapter these findings are discussed to ascertain the extent to which the partnership has effectively delivered various aspects of citizenship education and the consequent pedagogical protocols are explained. A model for developing international partnerships based on this narrative is suggested and the notion of 'living citizenship' is further examined. The conclusions that can be drawn from this narrative in terms of its implications for citizenship education and for the actions of government in promoting international educational partnerships are considered.