

APPENDIX 3

Transcript of Philosophical Enquiry

Question: Why not forget when it hurts to remember?

1. F: OK, and we're going to ask Josh if, again, he will just get us going in terms of our thinking about that so he can take us forward.
2. Josh: Well, it was all about, like I said before, um, about the first world war being called the war to end all wars, and then there's been all these hundreds of wars since, so obviously, um, it didn't ... sort of end war, and it was like, so terrible, people were willing to die because they thought that they were dying to stop, um all of the wars afterwards. But, they weren't, they were just in another war. And so, should we like, forget about all that and say it was a mistake. We were wrong. It was so terrible, if we remember it was so sad and horrible, there'll still be all these horrific pictures there'll be found and all that, or should we um, forge- - or should we remember the people who died and give them praise and um keep on um saying how brilliant they were and how heroic they were to die to end all wars when in fact, it didn't end all wars?
3. F: Thank you very much Josh for opening that all up for us. Ben?
4. Ben 1: Maybe the object, the uh, yeah, the thing they were aiming for wasn't to end all wars it was in that war to stop Hitler gaining power [chorus of interventions]
5. Josh: Hitler was in the first world war but he was only a private.
6. Harry: He left the battlefield - it was in the first ...
7. F: OK, just let Ben finish his thinking ...
8. Ben 1: In the second world war we wanted to stop Hitler from taking over the world, and if we hadn't have stood up to him then we probably wouldn't have been here.
9. Ben 2: We would.
10. Josh: The USA would have stood up to him.

11. F: Can I just ask, Ben you had your hand up earlier. Is that a similar thought to the one you had, or ...?
12. Ben 2: I had one similar but I changed my mind. Just going even further back – a few thousand years – uh, some people think that the Nazis were the gruesomest people in the world that ever lived, uh burning people, eating people who were dead, and the people who were still alive in the camps, eating the other dead people's insides, but uh, some people think they were the most gruesomest people, I don't think that. One, one like I could agree would be uh, what do you call them?
13. Sarah: Druids.
14. Ben 2: No, Sarah (younger sister), shut up ..., uh ... uh ..., come on ...
15. F: Don't worry too much about that Ben.
16. Ben 2: No, I think I've got it ... what are they called?
17. Josh: Give us a clue.
18. Ben 1: What did they used to do?
19. Ben 2: Uh ... I'll get to that when I remember their name, uh ...
20. Jack: Aztecs?
21. Ben 2: Yeah! Aztecs! 'Cos I think that their ...
22. Josh: Child sacrifices.
23. Ben 2: Yeah, sacrifices, and other people think that whilst that
[unclear]
24. Josh: Thinkers.
25. Ben 2: No.
26. F: I'm sorry to interrupt, boys, but is there a connection between this thought and the original question?
27. Ben 2: Yeah.

- 28.F: What is the connection between their gruesome behaviour, which ... I'm sure, sure you're right that they were responsible for, and about trying to forget when it hurts to remember?
- 29.Ben 2: Because, going back to the first world war ...
- 30.F: Mmm?
- 31.Ben 2: They used to work, like used a game, when the winners used to get sacrificed.
- 32.F: Right.
- 33.Ben 2: And, the parent, uh the mum and dad of the child who got sacrificed, would they cry their eyes out or would they be happy that their child got sacrificed?
- 34.F: So they wouldn't feel that they wanted to forget their child, and they'd be very proud?
- 35.Ben 2: Yeah, they'd be very proud or they'd be very sad?
- 36.F: Thank you very much for that. Harry, have you got a point as well?
- 37.Harry: Well yeah, in world war two, kamikaze pilots of Japan, yeah, they were willing to die for their country thinking that if they win this war then they could ... probably take power of the world and then there wouldn't be any more wars because the Japanese would rule the world and not have groups of this one, and this one fighting each other, and if somebody ruled the world on its own, then nobody would have to fight each other because you'd all be a bit like one big family of Japanese ...
- 38.F: So there are lots of thoughts about giving up your life and sacrificing your life for power and for the prestige of your parents etcetera, I'm having a little bit of a struggle though just connecting the two parts of our question which was around forgetting and it hurting to remember. Who can help me make those connections? Um, Ben we'll get back to you in a little while, Josh, could you ...?
- 39.Josh: Well, I think the idea is, should we remember these people who are willing to die, for their country, for peace, for the gods etcetera, uh with pride, that they were such brilliant, brave, strong people, or should we forget about them, because it's so sad that they all died. At the moment we're just like getting a list of all the people who died willingly, but, um, yeah, and also,

about all this gruesome behaviour and that, we come back again, Jack helped me decide that there was no such thing as evil, and you always - at the time you always think you made the right choice, even if you know that with this choice a million people are going to die, you think it's the right thing. You might think, I shouldn't have done that but at that very moment you think that it's the right thing to do even if you're like, um thinking, even if you like say, "Aha I know this is the wrong thing to do I'm going to harm these people", you think it's right to do the wrong thing at the right time.

40.F: The wrong thing at the right time? Right?

41.Josh: You're doing the wrong thing, at the right time, because you know it's the wrong thing, and you're trying to do it because it is wrong and you know it's wrong, just to harm these people so in your opinion it's the wrong thing at the right time.

42.F: Thank you Josh. Jack, do you want to take that on a bit?

43.Jack: Um, well I was thinking that to remember, we have, like snapshots throughout time, uh and classical paintings, and I feel that these pictures of wars, we don't want any more. Classical art is dead. It's dead, and modern art doesn't show all this pain and suffering, and, um, so we can forget about it. We can cast the classics aside, because they show all this horror and we can concentrate on the modern art which shows feelings, and it's just colours, and there isn't any pain – there can be pain in there, but not visible pain, so we can forget about it because it hurts to remember all that pain.

44.F: And do you think that was a conscious decision of the artists, Jack, to leave behind the classical tradition of sometimes showing great pain and suffering, but to express it in different ways, or different concepts in different ways – do you think they ...?

45.Jack: Yeah.

46.F: Different ways, do you think they made that conscious decision to ...? OK. Ben?

47.Ben 1: I'm just thinking about what Jack's just said now, I don't think that it was a conscious decision, they're showing emotional pain, not true pain as it would be, but when Harry talked about the kamikaze pilots, they only used them in defence. Kamikaze means 'divine wind' I think, because, in some time, one Japanese emperor, he was defending his country and the other enemies got blown away by a tornado or something, and they've only ever used it in defence, they only ever used it in the late battles against the

Americans. They didn't use it that often. It was only when they were in a state of like dire need.

48.F: I see.

49.Ben 1: So they weren't – they were like sacrificing themselves but not ...

50.F: Not for aggressive reasons?

51.Ben 1: No, as a like, last-ditch attempt, like for the ... for the continuation of their people almost.

52.F: Right. Thank you for clarifying that for us. Ben?

53.Ben 2: Going back, like way back, to when the Aztecs were around. They were one of the most remembered people in Mexico because ... they were one of the most intelligent people of their time because they invented, uh, quite a lot of inventions as well as ... [a contribution about the inventions of the Aztecs and the Vikings.]

54.F: Right, so all these cultures did have things which we remember now, as their contributions? Thank you. Ben? [A few further contributions about inventions from different cultures.]

55.F: [A request to take us back on course in relation to the question.]

56.Jack: What Ben and Ben are saying is that they have been gruesome and things that we should forget, like human sacrifices, but they have also had such positive contributions and we can't completely erase them from history because they've given us a lot and each one is a step to a perfect civilization. We're only a quarter of the way there but we can't forget them because they have helped us so what we're trying to say is that these people, although they were horrible people, they have given us so much that we can't completely forget them.

57.F: Thank you Jack. That's really helpful in helping me get a handle on where we were going with that discussion. Can I just ask from that, is there a related question then, that in order to make progress do we *need* some horrible things to happen? Is it necessary to have extremes before we actually make progress, that to forget the horrible things – or try to forget the horrible things – but in order to move on and take things forward? Harry – you have a thought?

58. Harry: Well, this is a horrible thing: if we didn't have wars, then the world would collapse. If we always had peace, then everyone would be friends, yeah? And, nobody could be friends forever. We've always got to be, like, at least one argument that will, like, separate them for a few days or something. And that's a bit of a horrible thing. So you can never have perfect peace. You've always got to have wars.

59. F: You've always got to have the opposite in order to understand something? To know where it comes from, um I'd like to give Clare and Sarah and Sam – is there anything you'd like to say because you've not really had an opportunity to come in. Is there any thought or observation you three would like to make?

[None forthcoming]

60. Ben 2: I'd just like to say in a few weeks or months or – and say ... [unclear] horrible things must happen. Like deaths must happen. Because if people didn't die, there couldn't be ... but if we didn't die, the world wouldn't be a nice place. Because, like, some people are glad that some people have died, and if we didn't die, just say that Sarah hated me and neither of us died until the end of time, like from the beginning to the end, if we didn't die that would make the world a horrible place because we hated each other and that hatred would carry on, if we really really really hated each other, like if Sarah poked my eye out I'd really hate her for the rest of my life, and if I died then that hatred between me and Sarah would have gone, or she may still hate me but when we both died it would have disappeared but if we both carried on living with the hatred the world wouldn't be a nice place. And uh, ...

61. F: Wow, I think it's a really deep thought you've come up with there.

62. Ben 2: I think it was Harry who said if there were no wars, if we were at peace with each other, there were no weapons, no weapons at all, and no-one invaded each other, that sort of thing.

63. [A number of contributions exploring the nature of war and strife, the emergence of evil in the world (analogy of a meteor bringing a virus to the world) and the 'impossibility' of achieving a perfect civilization.]

64. Harry: If you think of the world as a piece of ... custard! And you can stand on custard and it can be really soft and squishy. And that's like hatred and yeah, and it can be really strong and brittle and that's like love and everything so if you didn't have wars and everything was peaceful and then as Jack said like a meteor comes in and someone gets a virus and everyone gets a cold yeah? And everyone's going to get really upset and somebody's

going to die. Somebody's going to like, cough, and everyone's going to be like screaming their head off except that makes it, the custard, squishy.

65.F: Right?

66.Harry: Because upset can make things soft, that happiness can make things strong – except it can break.

67.F: Wow! There's something – phew! I wonder if somebody can help us express what Harry so brilliantly has just said there – how can we summarise that?

68.Ben 1: He was saying that – I wouldn't really use custard but I will – the skin of the custard represents love and everything good in this world whereas the runny part underneath it represents all the hatred and evil, and you can walk across that skin on the custard but at one point you will start to sink. Then you've got – you'll have – choices. If you take the right one you'll move ahead. If you take the wrong one, then, well, you're stuck.

69.F: A Goey custard death.

70.Ben 1: Yeah. But coming back to the bit where we said if we had a world of total peace, total peace would be mindless conformity, which would be bad. If everybody was totally happy, everybody would do the same thing. They'd all think the same thing. They'd all be the same, eat the same, live the same, and therefore that would be something that would hurt but, no I don't know, that would be Peace would not necessarily be a good thing. It could be a good experience

71.F: Wow, gosh, and yet we all say we want peace, you've used this discussion Ben to argue that total peace is not necessarily a great thing, and Josh has spotted something, we've got this poster up that says 'Let's build a culture of peace', but you're suggesting that if we had it, what an awful situation that would be! Nothing would be worth remembering because it would be so boring!

72.Ben 1: Yeah, there'd be nothing like to remember. It would be so, like bland, and everything would be white. Nothing would exist, like the way to express it in modern art would be a blank piece of paper.

73.Jack: Let's go back to this custard because Harry's just put this brilliant deep thought in my mind, like imagine this custard skin and a little legoman walking along it - because that's just about the right size - and right when you walk on the custard skin, the custard skin doesn't cover the entirety of the custard, it leaves little holes and gaps so when you stand on this

custard skin the evil which is the runny stuff underneath comes out of these gaps so when you're being good for yourself, you're squeezing evil out somewhere.

- 74.F: Wow! Gosh! So what conclusion, Jack can we draw from that?
- 75.Jack: That if you try to make yourself happy and there's peace, evil will seep and be growing and hatred will be growing because it's squeezing it up.
- 76.F: Are you saying it's actually quite selfish of us to try and be at peace for ourselves?
- 77.Jack: Love cannot be true if it is selfish ... so if you're kind and trying to be kind and helpful, you're making badness.
- 78.F: You disagree with that Ben, don't you? Say why.
- 79.Ben 1: Say evil does not exist as evil, but it exists as knowledge almost. Knowledge can be taken in two ways: knowledge of nuclear warfare – you could use your knowledge to find a way to stop nuclear warfare. But you could use your knowledge to blow up the world. So in that, in everything there is a good side and a bad side. Not necessarily evil, but yeah evil – it's not true evil – but you might blow up the world for what you think is a good reason at the time – yeah, coming back to Josh's thought – you did the wrong thing, but at the time you thought it was right. So, as we're walking across that custard, Jack is right that if we're doing it for ourselves, then if we had the peace within ourselves, this bad knowledge, whatever bad anything will come up through the holes in the custard. If we do it for other people we could practically FLY over that custard or hover almost - we wouldn't need even need to touch the skin of that custard.
- 80.Jack: But the more people who run over it would make more evil come out.
- 81.F: It depends, Ben is saying, on what speed they're moving.
- 82.Ben 1: Yeah.
- 83.F: If we're all holding hands and run like the clappers, there'd be the tiniest little footprints hardly making an impression on that skin.
- 84.Jack: Well they would make *some* impression.

85. Ben 1: Yes, they would, yes, but considering the amount of people there are running over it, or flying over it, then yeah – it's nothing! There has to be *some* evil for goodness to exist. So you need something there for the people there to know what evil is so they can hold, almost, peace.
86. F: Ben, I have a sense that you're not actually contradicting Harry and Jack's theory, you're actually just developing it.
87. Ben 1: Yeah!
88. F: And you're actually affirming it in some ways.
89. Ben 1: Yeah!
90. F: Because it's a very powerful image you've come up with you two – it really captures stuff; you know I never really thought I'd be grateful to custard but I am! Ben do you want to give us one or two closing thoughts because we need to bring things together soon?
91. Ben 2: [A contribution expressing the advisability of not getting rid of all our weapons in the event of some presently unforeseen need.]
92. F: Who can help us, help us summarise where we've got to with this discussion? A few quick thoughts from each of you with your hands up. Ben did you want to start?
93. Ben 1: Evil exists.
94. Josh: (Groans)
95. F: Evil exists is your first premise right?
96. Ben 1: Right? When we're fighting for peace, we're fighting for evil. We're fighting with evil. We think, we're under the illusion that we're fighting against evil, we're trying to stop it, but this is what evil wants, it wants everybody to be the same, because all evil has to do then is to invent one person, is to keep just one tiny - a millimetre - not even a millimetre out of this conformity and it can rule the world. It will have everything that we've worked for and we will not - we'll just be ... nothing. We won't be nothing - we'll be like a gas; we'll exist but we won't be alive, we won't have ...
97. Josh: Our minds and soul.
98. Ben 1: Yeah, we will just be like a whisp of mist.

99. Josh: We'd just be alive.
100. Ben 1: Yeah!
101. F: Thank you very much.
102. Ben 1: We'd just be like an empty crab-shell thing – like an empty skeleton almost. It exists but only ...
103. F: It has no substance, it has no meaning. Thank you very much Ben. Harry?
104. Harry: When Jack said, um what was it? When you're walking on the custard and you step on it and it comes out, well, say you've got some bug spray and there's a really annoying fly coming, you spray the bug, yeah? And that's going to kill it- you're happy – that's definitely happy that it's dead now, so in a way, when you do something to make you feel good, you're not making other people feel good at all.
105. Jack: On the Simpsons Homer joins a naval ship and he's on this submarine and he's reaching for this bowl of peas and the captain says to him, "What do you want in life Homer?" And he's concentrating on the peas and he goes "Peas!" and it sounds like 'peace' and the captain goes "And what's the best way to get peace?" and Homer says "With a knife!" and I think that's a good thought because I think the only way to get peace is with a knife.
106. [Hilarity]
107. Ben 1: But yes! The only way to get peace, *is* to do evil, and that's exactly what evil wants. Evil wants you to gain peace, by doing evil!
108. F: Last word back to Josh, to see if we can square the circle:
109. Josh: Well this is on evil again. So I thought - I think what we got at, we made this phrase, 'There's no such thing as evil.' What I meant by 'There's no such thing as evil' is there is no such thing as someone thinking, 'I'm doing evil!' Nobody does evil at the moment that they are doing it. They may think that that they did evil afterwards but at that moment they did not do it. Now there may be evil in the world, but there's no such thing as evil at the time that they're doing the evil deed.

End of enquiry.

